# HSPS Tripos, Part I

# **PAPER GUIDE**

# SAN 1. SOCIAL ANTHROPOLOGY: THE COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

# **Paper Coordinator**

Prof Matei Candea (<u>mc288@cam.ac.uk</u>) - Michaelmas term Dr Andrew Sanchez (<u>as2672@cam.ac.uk</u>) - Lent and Easter terms

# Paper Guide Contents:

INTRODUCTION TO SAN1 – p2

THE LECTURE SERIES IN DETAIL – p5 including reading lists and example supervision questions

MOCK EXAM - p46

#### INTRODUCTION TO SAN 1

# Paper Aims and Objectives

To introduce Social Anthropology by exploring ethnographic analysis of different societies and cultures; the comparative study of social institutions; and the different theoretical approaches involved in anthropological work.

# Syllabus

Social Anthropology addresses the really big question – what does it mean to be human? The discipline takes as its subject matter the full range of human social and cultural diversity. Social anthropology considers what this diversity tells us about the foundations and possibilities of human social and political life, and how contemporary social changes are experienced by people around the world.

In this paper we consider how categories like gender, family, sexuality, race, the economy, and the state are subject to radical cultural variation, and how everyday matters such as food, clothing, work, and trade may be bound up with religious and other symbolic meanings. You will also learn about the ideas and concepts developed by anthropologists in response to the challenge of understanding this diversity, and about the distinctive forms of ethnographic field research anthropologists use to gain close, first-hand knowledge of the societies they study.

# Structure of Teaching - Lectures and Supervisions

The course is delivered through a combination of lectures and supervisions.

# Supervisions

Students will receive regular supervisions covering the key topics of this course, in preparation for which an essay will normally be required. Supervisions are arranged by college Directors of Studies, and should be distributed evenly through each term, avoiding "bunching" of supervisions. A normal supervision load would be three supervisions in each of Michaelmas and Lent, and one or two in Easter; a small number of additional discussion/revision sessions, without requiring an essay may be helpful.

#### Lectures

A set of lectures running throughout the year supports students to build an increasingly advanced understanding of social anthropology. \*\* The second section of this guide provides detail on each of these lecture series \*\*

#### Michaelmas term

Lecture series I. How Anthropologists Think Dr Matei Candea (8 lectures, weeks 1-8)

**Lecture series II. Critical issues: Political and economic life** *Dr Andrew Sanchez* (8 lectures, weeks 1-8)

Lecture Series III (Part 1). Ethnographic Film Dr Tim Cooper (4 film screenings, Weeks 3, 6, 7 and 8)

In Michaelmas Term, students will be introduced to anthropology through two parallel and complementary series of lectures. *How anthropologists think* will explore key concepts and tools for thinking developed by anthropologists, and provide a critical overview of some important approaches, theoretical schools and moments in the intellectual history of the discipline. *Critical Issues: Political and economic life* focuses on the ways anthropologists have studied political and economics around the world.

#### Lent Term

Lecture series IV. Anthropology Now Various (8 lectures, weeks 1-8)
Lecture series V. Kinship, Love and Care Dr Perveez Mody (4 lectures, weeks 1-4)
Lecture series VI. Symbolism Dr Rupert Stasch (4 lectures, Weeks 5-8)

Having established an overview of key concepts and encountered a selection of recent anthropological topics of concern in Michaelmas, in Lent Term students will delve deeper into the core substantial topics and themes of anthropology through two sets of lectures which provide sustained explorations of Kinship and Symbolism. In *Anthropology now*, a number of different lecturers will present case-based explorations of topics at the forefront of current anthropological concern, such as political protest, the digital economy, race and racism, human-animal relations, or refugees and borders.

#### Easter Term

Lecture series VII. Ethnography Prof. Joel Robbins (7 lectures, Weeks 1-4)

In Easter term, *Ethnography* considers how ethnographic work is researched, written and read. The course also brings together a number of the key strands of the paper s through the in-depth analysis of two social groups via the 'core' ethnographies. *Kinship, Love and Care* considers how human beings structure and experience family and intimacy, and how anthropologists have debated those areas of life.

# The relationship between lectures and supervisions

- Lectures provide framing and background to a topic. They act as a map to a complex and extensive set of literatures and problems.
- Information gained from attending lectures must be supported by independent reading and essaywriting that students undertake under the guidance of their supervisors.
- It is through supervisions that students' substantive knowledge of the discipline will be developed, along with their skills in building critical and well-evidenced arguments. These are the knowledge and skills that will be assessed in the end-of-year examinations.
- During the year, supervisors will set students a series of topics to read and write about. These will
  be chosen from across the range of subjects lectured on, reflecting the range and diversity of the
  lecture course. When developing the learning pathway for your supervision, your supervisors may
  suggest new readings and questions that they feel best support you in your education. Some
  sample supervision topics relating to the different lecture series are included below.
- Supervisions and essays will not normally follow the order in which lectures are given.
- Different parts of the course are related in *multiple* ways. They are not separate modules. As the year progresses, you will piece together your own sense of 'the big picture' as you master the material and see for yourself connections between different topics.
- Your Director of Studies oversees your education for the year. Any concerns with your learning
  and supervision (including difficulties around organisation, essay writing and reading, and with
  your progress) should be directed to your Director of Studies so that they can support you and
  guide you towards solutions.

# Assessment

This paper is assessed through a **three-hour** written examination. Candidates must answer three questions from a choice of (approximately) 12, which reflect the range and diversity of the lecture course. Note however that not every topic that has been lectured on, and not every essay that you have written, will be directly reflected in the exam questions set. Answering exam questions is an exercise in producing new arguments from familiar material. Credit will be given to students who display a wide range of ethnographic knowledge drawing on material from across a range of lecture courses and beyond. \*\* A Mock exam paper is included at the end of this document\*\*

#### Ethnographic monographs

A characteristic feature of anthropology is the fact that it relies extensively on "ethnographic monographs": book-length arguments based on first-hand accounts of particular peoples, places and situations. You will encounter a range of ethnographic monographs on this course, but two in particular have been selected to act as your 'set texts':

Richards, A. (1982 [1956]) Chisungu: A Girl's Initiation Ceremony among the Bemba of Zambia. Second Edition. Introduction by J. S. La Fontaine. London: Routledge.

Robbins, J. (2004) Becoming Sinners: Christianity and Moral Torment in a Papua New Guinea Society. Berkeley: University of California Press.

The Department recommends that all students read these two books early during the year, and then return to them in the Easter Term, when they will be the subject of a course of lectures.

Beyond these, you are strongly encouraged to read ethnographic monographs on subjects you are interested in – this is the best way to get to grips with social anthropology. Anthropologists have written ethnographic monographs on a huge variety of topics and places, from prison life in Papua New Guinea to the craft of magicians in Paris, from blood donation in India to poetry in Egypt, from the rituals of weapons scientists in the USA to shamanism and hunting in Siberia. Don't hesitate to ask your supervisors and lecturers for reading suggestions.

# General Background Reading

Astuti, R. et al. (eds) (2007) Questions of Anthropology. Oxford: Berg.

Barnard, A. & J. Spencer (eds) (2011) Encyclopaedia of Social and Cultural Anthropology. Second Edition. London: Routledge.

Cambridge Encyclopedia of Anthropology: https://www.anthroencyclopedia.com/

Candea, M. (ed) (2018). Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory. London: Routledge.

Engelke, M. (2017). Think Like an Anthropologist. Pelican.

Eriksen, TH. (2015) Small Places, Large Issues. 4th Edition. Pluto Press.

# THE LECTURE SERIES IN DETAIL

# MICHAELMAS TERM

# Lecture series I. How anthropologists think: tools, theories and puzzles

#### Matei Candea

This set of lectures provides an introduction to some key anthropological puzzles, theories and tools for thinking. How is it that social arrangements persist even as the individuals in them move on? Why do our symbolic lives present intricate patterns which no one seems to have designed or intended? Why do people do things which seem not to be in their own interest? How do inequalities get entrenched and how can these change? Can one ever accurately represent the perspective of 'another culture'? Should one try? Given the combined weight of culture, society and history, are humans in any sense free? Over the past 150 years, anthropologists have developed fundamentally different answers to these questions, grounded in very different theories about the nature of culture and society. While many of these theories have been rightly critiqued and some aspects of them abandoned, they continue to provide useful tools for thinking about these and other pressing problems today.

Other lecture series on this course will introduce you to a spate of very recent and emergent concepts, arguments and theories. By contrast this set delves deep, in order to explore, interrogate, and contextualise historically and politically some fundamental key concepts (progress, culture, social structure, discourse, practice) which form the bedrock, the sedimented background of so much contemporary anthropological argument, and which have travelled beyond anthropology into public debate.

These lectures have three aims. The first is to give you a critical introduction to some elements of the intellectual history of the discipline, that will then allow you to situate the books and articles you will read in SAN1 during the rest of the year. The second aim is to open up a broader conversation about how knowledge works in the social sciences and humanities. The third aim is to give you a practical guide to building your own anthropological arguments.

#### Background Reading

\*Engelke, M. 2017. Think Like an Anthropologist. Pelican.

Candea, M. (ed) 2018. Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory. London: Routledge.

Kuper, Adam. 1973. Anthropologists and Anthropology: the British School 1922-1972. London: Allen Lane.

Layton, Robert. 1997. *An introduction to theory in Anthropology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. \*Stewart, M. 1997. The time of the Gypsies. Oxford: Westview Press. (I recommend you read this from cover to cover – I will be using it throughout the course to demonstrate how these different conceptual tools and schools live on in one key example.)

#### Lecture 1. Introduction: concepts, puzzles and theories

This first lecture introduces the broad themes of this lecture series. What are the key puzzles anthropologists have identified and how have different concepts of 'culture' and 'society' helped (or hindered) in resolving them? What is theory and why is it worth knowing about? This lecture introduces the idea that anthropology is the art of 'seeing things twice' – and that's what we're proposing to do to the theories examined here: to see them **both** as potentially useful tools for making sense of the world, **and** as products of a particular time, with particular blindspots, limits and political entailments that require critical examination.

Candea, M. 2018. Introduction: Echoes of a conversation. In *Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory*. London: Routledge.

Kuper, Adam. 1999. Culture: the anthropologists' account. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.

Kuhn, T. S. 1962. The structure of scientific revolutions. [Chicago]: University of Chicago Press.

Stewart, M. 1997. The time of the Gypsies. Oxford: Westview Press.

Mentioned in the lecture:

Yurchak, A. 2015. Bodies of Lenin. Representations 129, 116–157.

Dumit, J. 2004. Picturing Personhood: Brain Scans and Biomedical Identity. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University

# Lecture 2. 'Progress': evolution, development, and the problem of change

How can we explain the diversity of human social arrangements in different times and places? 19th century evolutionists relied on notions of 'progress', 'evolution' and 'development' to make sense of this diversity. They envisioned human groups being in different 'stages' of a single historical process. They imagined that by comparing accounts of the diverse customs of non-Western and Western peoples, historical and contemporary, they might be able to reconstruct a history of human progress – from 'primitive beginnings' to the 'modern age'. Contemporary anthropology in its various forms was born out of a critique of this evolutionist vision. Yet notions of 'progress' and 'development' are still with us today in various forms, and this lecture urges us to think critically about the work such concepts do.

\*Candea, M. 2018. Severed Roots: Evolutionism, Diffusionism and (Structural-) Functionalism. In *Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory* (ed) M. Candea. London: Routledge.

\*Kuper, Adam. 2005. The reinvention of primitive society: transformations of a myth. London: Routledge.

Spencer, H. 1867. First Principles. Second Edition. Williams and Norgate.

Morgan, L. H. 1877. Ancient society. New York,: H. Holt and company.

Trautmann, T. R. 1987. Lewis Henry Morgan and the Invention of Kinship. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Engels, Friedrich 1972 (1884) The Origin of the Family, Private Property, and the State. New York,: Pathfinder Press.

Firmin, J.-A. 2002 (1885). The Equality of the Human Races. University of Illinois Press.

Fluehr-Lobban, C. 2000. Anténor Firmin: Haitian Pioneer of Anthropology. *American Anthropologist* 102, 449–466.

Tylor, Edward B. 1889. 'On a method of investigating the development of institutions; applied to laws of marriage and descent'. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland*, 18, pp. 245-72. (including a response by Francis Galton)

Trautmann, T. R. 1992. The Revolution in Ethnological Time. Man 27, 379.

Engelke, M. 2017. Think Like an Anthropologist. Pelican. (Chapter 2)

Ferguson, J. 1996. Development. In *Encyclopedia of Social and Cultural Anthropology* (eds) A. Barnard & J. Spencer, 155–160. London: Routledge.

Boas and the birth of US cultural anthropology

\*Boas, F. 1896. The limitations of the comparative method of anthropology. Science 901–908.

Boas, F. 1989. A Franz Boas Reader: The Shaping of American Anthropology, 1883-1911 G. W. Stocking (ed ). University of Chicago Press.

Baker, L. D. 1994. The Location of Franz Boas within the African-American Struggle. *Critique of Anthropology* **14**, 199–217.

Du Bois, W. E. B. 1909. The Souls of Black Folk: essays and sketches. A.C. McClurg & co.

Harrison, F. V. 1992. The Du Boisian Legacy in Anthropology. Critique of Anthropology 12, 239-260.

Handler, R. 2009. The Uses of Incommensurability in Anthropology. New Literary History 40, 627–647.

Fieldwork and British social anthropology

\*Stocking, George W. 1983. The Ethnographer's Magic: Fieldwork in British Anthropology from Tylor to Malinowski. In *Observers Observed: Essays on Ethnographic Fieldwork*, edited by G. W. Stocking. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

\*Malinowski, B. 1922. Argonauts of the western Pacific.

Kuklick, Henrika 2011. 'Personal Equations: Reflections on the History of Fieldwork, with Special Reference to Sociocultural Anthropology'. *Isis* 102(1): 1–33.

# Lecture 3. 'Social structure': functionalism and the problem of stability

Individuals have different interests and perspectives, they often feel they are acting freely, and yet much of their social behaviour is repetitive, expectable and patterned. Individual humans change, grow old and die, and yet the institutions they live within persist. Anthropological functionalism (including the variant known as 'structural-functionalism') provided a powerful explanation of these puzzles, by arguing that each society could be seen as a stable, self-regulating assemblage of mutually functioning parts – rather like a giant organism. By envisaging each society as a whole, with its own stable 'social structures', its own logically articulated religious, legal, political arrangements, and its own broadly coherent world-view, functionalists demonstrated the possibility, efficiency, and elegance of alternative, non-Western ways of organising economy, politics, knowledge or family life. Aspects of this vision are still there implicitly in many contemporary anthropological analyses. But do notions of 'social structure' go too far in discounting the importance of history, change and transformation? And how did the perspectives of functionalists interface with the British colonial structures within which many of these studies were conducted? These critical questions are particularly important given the enduring work that notions of social and political 'structure' and structural effects, do in contemporary anthropology and public discourses.

Durkheim, E. 1964. The Rules of Sociological Method. New York: Free Press.

Kenyatta, J. 1938. Facing Mount Kenya. (Vintage Books ed edition). Vintage Books.

\*Radcliffe-Brown, A.R. 1940. 'On social structure'. *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland.* 70:1, 1-12 (also in Structure and function in primitive society –see below)

\*Richards, A. I. 1956. Chisungu: A Girl's Initiation Ceremony Among the Bemba of Zambia. Psychology Press.

Fortes, Meyer, and E. E. Evans-Pritchard, eds. 1940. *African Political Systems*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Radcliffe-Brown, A. R., ed. 1950 African Systems of Kinship and Marriage. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

\*Evans-Pritchard, E. E. 1940. The Nuer: A description of the modes of livelihood and political institutions of a Nilotic people. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

\*Evans-Pritchard, E. E 1950 Social Anthropology: Past and Present; The Marett Lecture, 1950. Man 50: 118–124.

Hutchinson, Sharon Elaine 1996 Nuer Dilemmas: Coping with Money, War, and the State. London: University of California Press.

On anthropology and colonialism

Fanon, F. 2001. The Wretched of the Earth. (New Ed edition). London: Penguin Classics.

\*Asad, Talal, ed. 1973. Anthropology and the Colonial Encounter. New York: Humanity Books. (esp intro and chapters by Asad and James)

\*Kuper, A. 1973. Anthropologists and Anthropology: The British School 1922-1972. London: Allen Lane. (chap. 4-6)

Pels, P. & O. Salemink 1994. Introduction: Five theses on ethnography as colonial practice. *History and Anthropology* **8**, 1–34.

Niehaus, I. 2017. Anthropology at the dawn of apartheid: Radcliffe-Brown and Malinowski's South African engagements, 1919–1934. *Focaal* **2017**, 103–117.

Foks, F. 2018. Bronislaw Malinowski, "Indirect Rule," and the Colonial Politics of Functionalist Anthropology, ca. 1925–1940. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* **60**, 35–57.

Gledhill, J. 2000. Power and its disguises: anthropological perspectives on politics. London; Sterling, VA: Pluto Press

Tilley, H. 2011. Africa as a living laboratory: empire, development, and the problem of scientific knowledge, 1870-1950. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. (intro and chapter 6)

# Lecture 4. 'Culture', mark I: structuralism and the search for patterns

Social structures might explain why human behaviour is often repetitive. But how can we explain the intricate and sophisticated patterns of human meaning-making and symbolism which no one seems to have intended or designed, and the way these make sense to individuals even when they can't explicitly pinpoint their logic. Why are some (but not all) wedding dresses white? Why do Europeans think rotten food is disgusting, unless it is cheese or wine? The much disputed anthropological concept of 'culture' comes in to make sense of these questions. While British functionalists were studying 'social structures', French anthropologist Claude Levi-Strauss developed an interest in a radically different kind of structure: the logical structures which hold together systems of signs. Language – a structured system of sounds – is the obvious example, and Levi-Strauss developed a hugely influential theory based on the notion that culture might be a similar kind of system. By studying ritual and religious practices, kinship arrangements, and myths, structuralists provided a powerful framework for understanding both the dizzying diversity and the fundamental commonality of human cultures. But were these structures really in the minds of the people anthropologists studied, or were they merely in the mind of anthropologists – or could it be both?

\*Stasch, R. 2018. Structuralism. In *Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory* (ed) M. Candea. London: Routledge.

Lévi-Strauss, C. (1969). The elementary structures of kinship .Boston,: Beacon Press.

Lévi-Strauss, C. (1962) Totemism (Merlin) - chs 3 and 4.

\*Lévi-Strauss, Claude. 1966. The savage mind. [Chicago]: University of Chicago Press.

Lévi-Strauss, C. 1955. The Structural Study of Myth. The Journal of American Folklore 68 (270):428-444.

Saussure, F. de 2013. Course in General Linguistics. (Reprint edition). London; New York: Bloomsbury Academic.

Edmund Leach, Lévi-Strauss (Collins, London, 1970/1996).

Ernest Gellner, 'What is Structuralisme?', in his, Relativism and the Social Sciences (Cambridge, 1985).

Bloch, Maurice. 1996. Structuralism. In *Encyclopedia of social and cultural anthropology*, edited by A. Barnard and J. Spencer. London: Routledge.

Dumont, Louis. 2006. Introduction to two theories of social anthropology: Descent Groups and Marriage alliance. Oxford: Berghahn.

Fisher, L. E. & O. Werner 1978. Explaining explanation: Tension in American anthropology. *Journal of anthropological research* **34**, 194–218.

\*Douglas, Mary 1966 Purity and Danger: An Analysis of the Concepts of Pollution and Taboo. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Vialles, Noémie. 1994. *Animal to edible*. Cambridge [England] ; New York, NY Paris: Cambridge University Press Editions de La Maison des sciences de l'homme.

Tambiah, S. J. 2017. Form and meaning of magical acts: A point of view. *HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory* 7, 451–473.

\*Leach, E. R. 2000. Animal Categories and Verbal Abuse. In *The Essential Edmund Leach, vol. 1*, edited by S. Hugh-Jones and J. Laidlaw. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Okely, Judith. 1983. The Traveller-Gypsies. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

# Lecture 5. 'Culture', mark II: interpretivism and the search for understanding.

Imagining 'culture' as a kind of grammatical structure does a good job of explaining some intricate and often unconscious symbolic patterns, but what about everything else? What about the richly layered, explicit cultural interactions and interpretations - the attitudes, motivations, the winks and nudges, the sense of appropriateness and politeness, the conventions about what might be funny, disgusting or sad - which make up people's (always partial but nevertheless significant) sense of belonging to the same meaningful world? American interpretivist anthropologists of the second half of the 20th century developed an influential approach to these questions, which sought not to explain cultural difference in general, but rather to model how one might understand both cultural coherence and cultural difference. In the process they revolutionised the anthropological concept of 'culture' and the work this concept could do. The key here is seeing that 'understanding' is precisely what cultural actors are constantly trying to do to and with one another. Humans are forever interpreting each other's actions and words; this 'intersubjective' work is what generates and sustains shared cultural words. Interpretive anthropologists such as Clifford Geertz, in turn cast themselves as experts at interpretation across cultures. Unlike structuralism's search for deep hidden structures beneath the surface of culture, interpretivism proposed a vision of culture as a kind of publicly visible text, which the anthropologist, in Geertz's famous phrase, "strains to read over the shoulders of those to whom they properly belong."

\*Clifford Geertz, *The Interpretation of Cultures.* (Basic Books, New York, 1973). (esp. chapters 'Thick Description' and 'Deep Play')

Geertz, C. 1985. Local Knowledge: Further Essays In Interpretive Anthropology. (3 edition). Basic Books.

Ortner, S. B. 1978. Sherpas Through their Rituals. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Rosen, L. 1984. Bargaining for reality: the construction of social relations in a Muslim community. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

\*Laidlaw, J. 2018. Interpretive Cultural Anthropology: Geertz and his 'Writing-Culture' Critics. In Schools and Styles of anthropological theory (ed) M. Candea. London: Routledge.

Sources of interpretivism: Weber and US cultural anthropology

Weber, Max 1978. Economy and Society: An Outline of Interpretive Sociology. Univ of California Press.

Mead, Margaret 2001 Coming of Age in Samoa: A Psychological Study of Primitive Youth for Western Civilisation. Reprint edition. New York: William Morrow Paperbacks.

Benedict, R. 1946. The Chrysanthemum and the Sword: Patterns of Japanese Culture. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Schutz, A. 1967. The Phenomenology of the Social World. Northwestern University Press.

\*Engelke, M. 2017. Think Like an Anthropologist. Pelican. (Chapter 1)

Some critical engagements (see also next week)

Asad, T. 1979. Anthropology and the Analysis of Ideology. Man New Series 14, 607–627.

Keesing, R. 1987. Anthropology as Interpretive Quest [and Comments and Reply]. *Current Anthropology* **28**, 161–176.

Spencer, J. 1989. Anthropology as a Kind of Writing. Man 24, 145.

Abu-Lughod, L. 1991. Writing Against Culture. In *Recapturing Anthropology* (ed) R. C. Fox, 137–162. Santa Fe, N.M.: School of American Research Press.

# Lecture 6. 'Discourse': Critiques of anthropology and the problem of representation.

Soon however, a younger generation of anthropologists raised some questions about this interpretive vision. Were cultures really as internally coherent and externally bounded as interpretivists seemed to make out? And if so, what made anthropologists so good at interpretation? A foundational critical volume, *Writing Culture*, raised the contention that these visions of clearly delineated cultural worlds and omniscient anthropological interpreters were in part at least fictional constructs – results of particular writerly techniques and rhetorical strategies. In making such claims, anthropologists were drawing on postmodern critiques of scientific authority more generally, but also on a range of arguments by feminist, Marxist and postcolonial scholars, who had pointed to the political nature and political effects of scientific (including anthropological) knowledge, and raised fundamental questions about who ought or can write authoritatively about what (and for whom), within and across distinctions of class, gender, ethnicity or race. In the process a new set of conceptual tools, including Michel Foucault's notions of 'power/knowledge' and 'discourse' came to prominence in anthropological analysis and debate.

On and around 'Writing Culture'

\*Clifford, James, and George Marcus, eds. 1986. Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography. Berkeley: University of California Press. (esp chapters by Crapanzano, Asad and Rosaldo)

Foucault, Michel. 1979. What is an Author? In *Textual Strategies*, edited by J. V. Harari. Ithaca: New York University Press.

Said, Edward W. 1979. Orientalism. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Clifford, J. 1980. Review essays: Orientalism (Edward W. Said). *History and Theory* **19**, 204–223. Rabinow, P. (1977). Reflections on fieldwork in Morocco. Berkeley: University of California Press. Fabian, J. 1983. *Time and the Other, How Anthropology Makes Its Object*. New York: Columbia University Press.

\*Geertz, Clifford. 1988. Works and Lives: the Anthropologist as Author. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Some critiques of 'Writing Culture'

Sangren, P. S. 1988. Rhetoric and the Authority of Ethnography:" Postmodernism" and the Social Reproduction of Texts. *Current Anthropology* 

Carrithers, M. 1988. The Anthropologist as Author: Geertz's 'Works and Lives'. *Anthropology Today* **4**, 19–22

Dresch, P. 1992. Ethnography and general theory or people versus humankind. *Journal of the Anthropological Society of Oxford* **23**, 17–36.

Handelman, D. 1994 'Critiques of Anthropology: Literary Turns, Slippery Bends'. *Poetics Today* 15(3): 341–381.

On being double and seeing twice: writing and identity

\*Strathern, M. 1987. An awkward relationship: The case of feminism and anthropology. *Signs: Journal of Women, Culture and Society* **12**, 276–292.

\*Abu-Lughod, L. 1991. Writing Against Culture. In Recapturing Anthropology (ed) R. C. Fox, 137–162. Santa Fe, N.M.: School of American Research Press.

Narayan, K. 1993. How Native Is a "Native" Anthropologist? American Anthropologist, New Series 95, 671–686.

Behar, R. & D. A. Gordon (eds) 1996. Women Writing Culture. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Allen, E. 1992. Ever Feeling One's Twoness: 'Double ideals' and 'double consciousness' in the souls of black folk. *Critique of Anthropology* **12**, 261–275.

Fanon, F. 2007. *Black Skin, White Masks* (trans R. Philcox). (Revised edition). New York: Berkeley, Calif.: Grove Press / Atlantic Monthly Press.

Spivak, G. C. 1988. Can the subaltern speak? Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture 271-313.

Weiner, A. B. 1988. The Trobrianders of Papua New Guinea. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Josephides, L. 1985. The production of inequality: gender and exchange among the Kewa. London; New York: Tavistock.

Cusicanqui, S. R. 2012. Ch'ixinakax utxiwa: A Reflection on the Practices and Discourses of Decolonization. *South Atlantic Quarterly* **111**, 95–109.

Allen, J. S. & R. C. Jobson 2016. The Decolonizing Generation: (Race and) Theory in Anthropology since the Eighties. *Current Anthropology* **57**, 129–148.

Johnson, J. 2018. Feminist anthropology and the question of gender. In *Schools and Styles of anthropological theory* (ed) M. Candea. London: Routledge.

See also

Haraway, D. J. 1989. *Primate visions: Gender, race and nature in the world of modern science*. London: Routledge. Martin, Emily. (1991) "The Egg and the Sperm: How Science Has Constructed a Romance Based on Stereotypical Male-Female Roles." *Signs*, 485–501.

# Lecture 7 'Practice': Bodies, habits and the problem of agency

While some of the critiques of anthropological representation were in danger of getting lost in postmodern abstraction and endless reflexivity (as the joke about the postmodern anthropologist goes "But that's enough about me, what do you think about me?"), another rising school of thought came at the enduring questions of inequality, power, historical change and identity from a different angle. "Practice Theory" combined core themes from Marxist work on ideology and political economy, with insights drawn from the various anthropological traditions we have examined so far – and a few others. Practice theory returned to some of the fundamental puzzles we have encountered so far: how can we make sense of the articulation of social stability and social change? How far do social and political structures constrain human action and under what conditions can and do individuals push back? How can we explain the powerful ways in which perspectives are grounded in and shaped by social and cultural differences? A key to resolving these puzzles lay for practice theorists in paying attention to the human body, not as a mere natural object, but as a lived-in, cultivated, trained, material source of human "practice". And yet this seemingly all-encompassing theory still had some important blind-spots, as critics soon came to point out.

Bloch, M. 1985 Marxism and anthropology. The history of a relationship (OUP) SEP.

Humphrey, C. 2018. Marxism and Neo-Marxism. In *Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory* (ed) M. Candea. London: Routledge.

\*Sneath, D. 2018. From Transactionalism to Practice Theory. In Schools and Styles of anthropological theory (ed) M. Candea. London: Routledge.

\*Ortner, S. B. 1984. Theory in Anthropology since the Sixties. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 26 (1):126-166.

\*Bourdieu, Pierre. 1977. Outline of a Theory of Practice. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu, Pierre 1990 The Logic of Practice (chs 1 and 5)

Jenkins, R 1992 Pierre Bourdieu (esp. chapter 2)

Bourdieu, P. 1984. Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste. London: Routledge.

\*Cowan, J. K. (1990). Dance and the Body Politic in Northern Greece. Princeton: Princeton University Press. Abu-Lughod, L. 1986. Veiled Sentiments: Honour and poetry in a Bedouin society. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Allison, A. 1991. Japanese mothers and Obentos: The lunch-box as ideological state apparatus. *Anthropological Quarterly* **64**, 195–208.

Benson, S. 1997. The Body, health and eating disorders, vol. Identity and Difference: Culture, Media and Identity. In *Identity and Difference: Culture, Media and Identity* (ed) L. Jaynes. London: Open University. Benson, Susan. 2000. Inscriptions of the self: reflections on tattooing and piercing in contemporary

Euro-America. In Written on the body: The tattoo in European and American history, edited by J. Caplan. London: Reaktion Books.

Laidlaw, J. 2002. For an Anthropology of Ethics and Freedom. *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 8 (2):311-332.

Laidlaw, J. 2014. The subject of virtue: an anthropology of ethics and freedom. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Rosenblatt, D. 2013. Stuff the Professional Managerial Class Likes: 'Distinction' for an Egalitarian Elite. *Anthropological Quarterly* **86**, 589–623.

\*Stewart, M. 1997. The time of the Gypsies. Oxford: Westview Press.

# Lecture 8. Conclusion: Bringing it all together

Presenting theoretical schools sequentially as we have done here is useful because it allows one to see how each school built itself in part on a critique of previous positions, or on the contrary, recuperated elements of previous positions. It allows us to see theories as moments in an ongoing conversation. But the image of a sequence of theories can be misleading if one takes it to mean that theories have a neat beginning and end, that they follow each other in a sequence of constant improvement, such that new theories are best and 'old' theories are only of historical interest.

As we have seen throughout these lectures, anthropological theories are neither self-contained wholes (like the 'cultures' imagined by some interpretivists), nor stages towards scientific progress (like the 'societies' imagined by some evolutionists). Rather they are collections of arguments, perspectives and conceptual tools, some of which remain useful even when other problems with the theory have been identified.

To demonstrate this, the final lecture examines the way in which all of the schools we have examined in these lectures have left traces in one single anthropological work: Michael Stewart's *The Time of the Gypsies*.

\*Stewart, M. 1997. The time of the Gypsies. Oxford: Westview Press.

Abbott, A. 2001. Chaos of Disciplines. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Abbott, A. 2004. Methods of Discovery: Heuristics for the Social Sciences. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.

# Example supervision question:

'You have to leave some things out in order to build a successful theoretical model'. Discuss in relation to structural-functionalist notions of social structure.

#### Suggested readings

Theoretical background

Candea, M. 2018. Introduction: Echoes of a conversation. In *Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory*. London: Routledge.

Candea, M. 2018. Severed Roots: Evolutionism, Diffusionism and (Structural-) Functionalism. In *Schools and Styles of Anthropological Theory* (ed) M. Candea. London: Routledge.

Kuper, A. 1973. Anthropologists and Anthropology: The British School 1922-1972. London: Allen Lane. Radcliffe-Brown, A.R. 1940. 'On social structure'. The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland. 70:1, 1-12

Some examples of structural-functionalist analysis

Fortes, Meyer, and E. E. Evans-Pritchard, eds. 1940. African Political Systems. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Radcliffe-Brown, A. R., ed. 1950 *African Systems of Kinship and Marriage*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Evans-Pritchard, E. E. 1940. The Nuer: A description of the modes of livelihood and political institutions of a Nilotic people. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

(you could usefully compare this with a much later ethnography of the Nuer: Hutchinson, Sharon Elaine 1996 *Nuer Dilemmas: Coping with Money, War, and the State.* London: University of California Press.

Some critiques and reconsiderations of structural-functionalism

\*Evans-Pritchard, E. E 1950 Social Anthropology: Past and Present; The Marett Lecture, 1950. Man 50: 118–124.

Leach, E. R. 1966. Rethinking anthropology. London, New York: Athlone P.; Humanities P.

Needham, R. 1975. Polythetic Classification: Convergence and Consequences. Man 10, 349-369.

Asad, Talal, ed. 1973. Anthropology and the Colonial Encounter. New York: Humanity Books. (esp intro and chapters by Asad and James)

Niehaus, I. 2017. Anthropology at the dawn of apartheid: Radcliffe-Brown and Malinowski's South African engagements, 1919–1934. *Focaal* **2017**, 103–117.

Foks, F. 2018. Bronislaw Malinowski, "Indirect Rule," and the Colonial Politics of Functionalist Anthropology, ca. 1925–1940. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* **60**, 35–57.

# Lecture series II. Critical Issues: Political and Economic Life Dr. Andrew Sanchez

This course explores how social anthropology approaches the most critical issues of political and economic life. We do so by focussing upon comparative analyses of power and resistance, nationalism, conflict, inequality, exchange, work, environment, and development. These topics form the core of political and economic anthropology, and are engaged with by ethnographers working in all global societies.

The course demonstrates how Social Anthropology uses ethnographic study to provide unique insights into the nature of power and economy. By the end of the term, our engagement with these debates will help us to develop a more critical, comparative understanding of how human beings structure and experience their societies.

# Background Reading:

Carrier, J. (ed.) 2022. A Handbook of Economic Anthropology 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition (Edward Elgar).

Das, V. & S. Randeria. (eds.) 2015. *Politics of the Urban Poor* (Current Anthropology 56:11).

Eriksen, TH. & and E. Schober. (eds.) 2017. Knowledge and Power in an Overheated World (University of Oslo Press)

Hart, K, et al. (eds). 2010. The Human Economy: A Citizens Guide. (Polity Press)

Lazar, S. & Sanchez A. (eds). 2019. Labour Politics in an Age of Precarity (Dialectical Anthropology 43: 1)

Sharma, A. & A. Gupta (eds.) 2006. The Anthropology of the State: A Reader (Blackwell)

#### Lecture 1. Power and resistance

- What is the relationship between power and authority?
- Are relations of power inherently coercive?
- What types of behaviour constitute 'resistance'?

# Core Reading:

Abu-Lughod, L. 1990. 'The Romance of Resistance: Tracing Transformations of Power Through Bedouin Women' American Ethnologist 17(1): 41-55

Caton, SC. & Zacka, B. 2010. 'Abu Ghraib, the Security Apparatus, and the Performativity of Power' American Ethnologist 37 (2): 203-211

Maskovsky, J. 2018. 'Reclaiming the Streets: Black Urban Insurgency and Antisocial Security in Twenty-First-Century Philadelphia' Focaal 79: 39-53

### Recommended Reading:

Sa'ar, A. 2006. 'Feminine Strength: Reflections on Power and Gender in Israeli-Palestinian Culture' Anthropological Quarterly 79 (3): 397-430

Scott, JC. 1985. 'Normal Exploitation, Normal Resistance' in J.C. Scott Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance (Yale University Press) pp. 28-48

Wilde, M. 2017. 'Utopian Disjunctures: Popular Democracy and the Communal State in Urban Venezuela' Critique of Anthropology 37 (1): 47-66

#### Further Reading:

Freeman, L. 2007. 'Why Are Some People Powerful?' in R. Astuti et al (eds) Questions of Anthropology (Berghahn) pp. 281-307

Ong, A. 1987. 'The Production of Possession: Spirits and the Multinational Corporation in Malaysia' American Ethnologist 15(1): 28-42

Sahlins, MD. 1963. 'Poor Man, Rich Man, Big-Man, Chief: Political Types in Melanesia and Polynesia' Comparative Studies in Society and History 5 (3): 285-303

#### Lecture 2. Nationalism

- Is a nation state an 'Imagined Community'?
- How is the development of modern nation states related to colonialism?
- Why is nationalism more prevalent at some times than others?

#### Core Reading:

Anderson, B. 2006 [1983]. 'Introduction' & 'The Origins of National Consciousness' in B. Anderson Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism (London: Verso) pp.1-9, 37-46

Hall, K., Goldstein, DM, & Ingram, MB. 2016. 'The Hands of Donald Trump: Entertainment, Gesture, Spectacle' HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory 6(2): 71-100

Thorleifsson, C. 2017. 'Disposable Strangers: Far Right Securitisation of Forced Migration in Hungary' Social Anthropology 25 (3): 318-334

#### Recommended Reading:

Chatterjee, P. 1993. 'Whose Imagined Community?' in P. Chatterjee The Nation and its Fragments: Colonial and Post-Colonial Histories' (Princeton: Princeton University Press) pp. 3-14

Hage, G. 2000. 'Introduction' in G. Hage White Nation: Fantasies of White Supremacy in a Multicultural Society (New York: Routledge). pp. 15-26

Koning de, A. & Modest, W. 2017. 'Anxious Politics in Postcolonial Europe' American Anthropologist 119(3): 524-526.

#### Further Reading:

Boyer, D. & Lomnitz, C. 2005. 'Intellectuals and Nationalism: Anthropological Engagements' Annual Review of Anthropology Vol. 34: 105-120

Eriksen, TH. 1994. 'Nationalism, Mauritian Style: Cultural Unity and Ethnic Diversity' Comparative Studies in Society and History Vol. 36, No. 3 pp. 549-574

Evans, G. 2012. "The Aboriginal People of England": The Culture of Class Politics in Contemporary Britain' Focaal—Journal of Global and Historical Anthropology 62: 17–29

#### Lecture 3. War and Conflict

- Are human beings naturally prone to war and social conflict?
- How does war impact everyday life?

How do societies engage with histories of suffering and violence?

#### Core Reading:

Calis, I. 2017. 'Routine & Rupture: The Everyday Workings of Abyssal (Dis)Order in the Palestinian Foodbasket' American Ethnologist 44 (1): 65-76

Fry, DP. 2007. 'Do Nonwarring Societies Actually Exist?' in DP. Fry Beyond War: The Human Potential for Peace (New York, NY: Oxford University Press) pp. 10-20

Stewart, M. S. 2004. 'Remembering without commemoration: The mnemonics and politics of Holocaust memories among European Roma' Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 10(4): 561-582.

### Recommended Reading:

Al-Mohammed, H. 2015. 'Poverty beyond Disaster in Postinvasion Iraq: Ethics and the "Rough Ground" of the Everyday' Current Anthropology 56 (11) pp. 108-115

Lizot, J. & Dart, S. 1994. 'On Warfare: An Answer to N.A. Chagnon'. American Ethnologist 21: 845-862.

Wilson, RA. 2000. 'Reconciliation and Revenge in Post-Apartheid South Africa' Current Anthropology 41(1): 75-98.

#### Further Reading:

Blick, JP. 1988. 'Genocidal Warfare in Tribal Societies as a Result of European-Induced Culture Conflict'. Man, vol. 23 (4): 654-70

Green, L. 1994. 'Fear as a Way of Life' Cultural Anthropology 9(2): 227-256

Meierhenrich, J. 2009. 'The Transformation of Lieux de Mémoire. The Nyabarongo River in Rwanda, 1992-2009'. Anthropology Today 25 (5):13-19

# Lecture 4. Inequality

- Is social inequality a human universal?
- How does inequality relate to race, gender, and class?
- Is the world more unequal than it used to be?

#### Core Reading:

Buitron, N. 2020. 'Autonomy, Productiveness, and Community: The Rise of Inequality in an Amazonian Society'. The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 26(1): 48-66.

Hickel, J. 2017. 'The End of Poverty... Has Been Postponed' In J. Hickel The Divide: A Brief Guide to Global Inequality and its Solutions. (London: Penguin Random House)

Koning de, A. 2017. "Handled with care': Diffuse policing and the production of inequality in Amsterdam' Ethnography 18(4): 535-555.

#### Recommended Reading:

Lukose, R. 2018. 'Decolonizing Feminism in the #MeToo Era' The Cambridge Journal of Anthropology 36(2): 34-52

Rosenblatt, D. 2013. 'Stuff the Professional-Managerial Class Likes: "Distinction" for an Egalitarian Elite' Anthropological Quarterly Vol. 86, No. 2 pp. 589-623

Rouse, C. 2010. 'Patient and Practitioner Noncompliance: Rationing, Therapeutic Uncertainty, and the Missing Conversation' Anthropology & Medicine 17:2: 187-200

#### Further Reading:

Bettie, J. 2000. 'Women without Class: Chicas, Cholas, Trash and the Presence/Absence of Class Identity' Signs 26(1): 1-35

Crenshaw, K. 1989. 'Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics' University of Chicago Legal Forum 1989 (1): 139-167

Koch, I. 2018. 'Towards an Anthropology of Global Inequalities and their Local Manifestations: Social Anthropology in 2017' Social Anthropology 26(2): 253-268

# Lecture 5. Exchange

- Why is economic exchange important to building relationships?
- How does exchange relate to social status?
- Why are anthropological ideas about gift exchange helpful to social scientists?

#### Core Reading:

Bornstein, E. 2009. 'The Impulse of Philanthropy' Cultural Anthropology 24 (4): 622-651

Dolan, C. 2007. 'Market Affections: Moral Encounters with Kenyan Fairtrade Flowers' Ethnos 72 (2): 239–261

Mauss, M. 2002. 'Introduction' in The Gift: The Form and Reason for Exchange in Archaic Societies (London: Routledge Classics). pp. 1-10

#### Recommended Reading:

Appadurai, A. 1986. 'Introduction: Commodities and the Politics of Value'. In A. Appadurai (Ed.), The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press) pp. 3-63

Gell, A. 1992. Inter-Tribal Commodity Barter and Reproductive Gift-Exchange in Old Melanesia' in C. Humphrey, Caroline & S. Hugh-Jones Barter, Exchange, Value: An Anthropological Approach (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press). pp.142-168

Yan, Y. 2020. 'Gifts'. In The Cambridge Encyclopedia of Anthropology (eds) F. Stein, S. Lazar, M. Candea, H. Diemberger, J. Robbins, A. Sanchez & R. Stasch.

#### Further Reading:

Bolt, S. 2012. "Dead Bodies Matter: Gift Giving and the Unveiling of Body Donor Monuments in the Netherlands." Medical Anthropology Quarterly 26 (4): 613–634.

Graeber, D. 2001. 'Marcel Mauss Revisited' in D. Graeber Towards an Anthropological Theory of Value: The False Coin of Our Own Dreams (London; New York: Palgrave) pp151-229

Malinowski, B. 1920. 'Kula: the circulating exchange of valuables in the archipelagos of eastern New Guinea', Man 20 pp.97-105.

#### Lecture 6. Work

- What types of work do people find satisfying?
- How do societies differ in their conception of what 'work' means?
- Why is social anthropology useful for understanding modern employment conditions?

#### Core Reading:

Graeber, D. 2018. 'Preface' & 'What is a Bullshit Job?' in D. Graeber <u>Bullshit Jobs: A Theory</u> (London, New York: Penguin) pp. 9-40

Lee, R. 1979. 'Men, Women, and Work'. In R. Lee. 'The !Kung San: Men, Women, and Work in a Foraging Society' (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press) pp. 250-280

Sanchez, A. 2020. 'Transformation and the Satisfaction of Work' Social Analysis 64(3): 68-94

#### Recommended Reading:

Gershon, I. 2017. 'Introduction: The Company You Keep' in I. Gershon. Down and Out in the New Economy: How People Find (or Don't Find) Work Today (Chicago: University of Chicago Press)

Lazar, S. & Sanchez, A. 2019. 'Understanding Labour Politics in an Age of Precarity'. Dialectical Anthropology 43(1): 3-14

Lewis, JS. 2022. 'Subject to Labor: Racial Capitalism and Ontology in the Post-Emancipation Caribbean' Geoforum 132: 247-251

# Further Reading:

Harris, O. 2007. What Makes People Work?' in R. Astuti et al (eds). Questions of Anthropology (Oxford; New York: Berghahn) pp. 137-167

Prentice, R. 2008. 'Knowledge, Skill, and the Inculcation of the Anthropologist: Reflections on Learning to Sew in the Field' Anthropology of Work Review 29(3):54-61

Rajkovic, I. 2017. 'For an Anthropology of the Demoralized: State Pay, Mock-Labour, and Unfreedom in a Serbian Firm' Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 24 (1): 47-70.

#### Lecture 7. Environment

- How do conceptions of the environment vary in different societies?
- What is the 'anthropocene' epoch, and are we living in it?
- How does anthropology contribute to understandings of environmental crisis?

# Core Reading:

Mathur, N. 2015. "It's a Conspiracy Theory and Climate Change": Of Beastly Encounters and Cervine Disappearances in Himalayan India'. HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory 5(1):87-111

O'Reilly, J. et al. 2020. 'Climate Change: Expanding Anthropological Possibilities'. Annual Review of Anthropology. 49: 13–29

Rappaport, R. 1967 'Ritual Regulation of Environmental Relations among a New Guinea People' Ethnology 6 (1): 17-30

#### **Recommended Reading:**

Babidge, S., 2019. 'Sustaining Ignorance: the Uncertainties of Groundwater and its Extraction in the Salar de Atacama, Northern Chile: Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 25: 83–102

Brosius, JP. 1999 'Green Dots, Pink Hearts: Displacing Politics from the Malaysian Rain Forest' American Anthropologist 101(1): 36-57

Chua, L. & H. Fair. 2019. 'Anthropocene'. In The Cambridge Encyclopedia of Anthropology (eds) F. Stein, S. Lazar, M. Candea, H. Diemberger, J. Robbins, A. Sanchez & R. Stasch.

#### Further Reading:

Cassidy, R. 2012. 'Lives with Others: Climate Change and Human-Animal Relations'. Annual Review of Anthropology 41, pp. 21–36

Lipset, D. 2011. 'The Tides: Masculinity and Climate Change in Coastal Papua New Guinea.' Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 17(1): 20-43

Masquelier, A. 2006. 'Why Katrina's Victims Aren't Refugees: Musings on a "Dirty" Word'. American Anthropologist 108(4): 735-743

# Lecture 8. Development

- How does international development relate to empire and colonialism?
- What should be the focus of international development efforts?
- Why are anthropologists often so critical of development professionals?

#### Core Reading:

Chua, L. 2016. 'Gifting, Dam(n)ing and the Ambiguation of Development in Malaysian Borneo' Ethnos 81 (4): 735-757

Ferguson, J. & Lohman, L. 2016 [1994]. "The Anti-Politics Machine: "Development" and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho'. in N.Haenn et al. <u>The Environment in Anthropology: A Reader in Ecology, Culture, and Sustainable Living</u> (New York: NYU Press) pp. 185-196

Mosse, D. 2004. 'Is Good Policy Unimplementable? Reflections on the Ethnography of Aid Policy and Practice' Development and Change 35(4): 639-671

#### Recommended Reading:

Bornstein, E. & Sharma, A. 2016. 'The Righteous and the Rightful: The Technomoral Politics of NGOs, Social Movements, and the State in India' American Ethnologist 43(1):76-90

Huang, J. 2017. 'The Ambiguous Figures of Social Enterprise: Gendered Flexibility and Relational Work among the iAgents of Bangladesh.' American Ethnologist 44(4): 603-616.

Kar, S. 2017. 'Relative Indemnity: Risk, Insurance, and Kinship in Indian Microfinance.' Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 23(2): 302-319.

#### Further Reading:

Gupta, A. 2015. 'An Anthropology of Electricity from the Global South'. Cultural Anthropology 30 (4):555-68

Heslop, L. & L. Jeffery. 2020. 'Roadwork: Expertise at Work Building Roads in the Maldives'. Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 26(2): 284-301

Zhang, L. 2006 'Contesting Spatial Modernity in Late-Socialist China' Current Anthropology 47 (3): 461-484

# Example supervision topic

'All exercises of power are essentially coercive'
Critically discuss this claim with reference to a range of ethnographic and theoretical material.

#### Recommended Reading

Abu-Lughod, L. 1990. 'The Romance of Resistance: Tracing Transformations of Power Through Bedouin Women' American Ethnologist 17(1): 41-55

Caton, SC. & Zacka, B. 2010. 'Abu Ghraib, the Security Apparatus, and the Performativity of Power' *American Ethnologist* 37 (2): 203-211

Freeman, L. 2007. 'Why Are Some People Powerful?' in R. Astuti et al (eds) *Questions of Anthropology* (Berghahn) pp. 281-307

Maskovsky, J. 2018. 'Reclaiming the Streets: Black Urban Insurgency and Antisocial Security in Twenty-First-Century Philadelphia' Focaal 79: 39-53

Ong, A. 1987. 'The Production of Possession: Spirits and the Multinational Corporation in Malaysia' *American Ethnologist* 15(1): 28-42

Sa'ar, A. 2006. 'Feminine Strength: Reflections on Power and Gender in Israeli-Palestinian Culture' Anthropological Quarterly 79 (3): 397-430

Sahlins, MD. 1963. 'Poor Man, Rich Man, Big-Man, Chief: Political Types in Melanesia and Polynesia' Comparative Studies in Society and History 5 (3): 285-303

Scott, JC. 1985. 'Normal Exploitation, Normal Resistance' in J.C. Scott Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance (Yale University Press) pp. 28-48

Wilde, M. 2017. 'Utopian Disjunctures: Popular Democracy and the Communal State in Urban Venezuela' Critique of Anthropology 37 (1): 47-66

# Lecture series III. Ethnographic Film Dr Tim Cooper (Michaelmas term, weeks 3, 6,7 and 8)

This module consists of a series of film screenings and post-film discussions intended to introduce students to the history and possibilities of ethnographic film as a medium of anthropological understanding and education. The directions of discussion are entirely open to students' own responses to the films and curiosity about them. One concern of each viewing will be with the ethnographic 'content' of the films: what information have we learned as viewers, what generalizing interpretations of the shape of some people's world have we been given by the film, and how does this content relate to what students are learning in other parts of the SAN 1 curriculum. Another concern of each viewing will be to see the film as a film. How is it put together? What are its formal properties? How does it compare to other films in the wider genre of ethnographic film, to ethnographic writing, to other kinds of documentary films, or to more popular genres of audiovisual media? How do variations in how ethnographic films have been constructed over time compare to how ethnographic writing has changed? In this way, we try to inquire not only into what anthropological knowledge can be gained through film, but also what kinds of social and cultural structures are built into activities of making and watching specific genres of visual media.

#### **Background Readings:**

Banks, Marcus. 1992. "Which films are the ethnographic films?" pp. 116-130 in P. Crawford, and D. Turton, David, eds. 1992. Film as Ethnography. Manchester: Manchester University Press.]

Loizos, Peter. Ch. 1 in his Innovation in Ethnographic film: From Innocence to Self-Consciousness, 1955-85. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

MacDougall, David. 1995. "Beyond Observational Cinema," pp. 115-132 in P. Hockings, ed. Principles of Visual Anthropology. New York: Mouton de Gruyter.

Ruby, Jay. 1975. "Is an Ethnographic Film a Filmic Ethnography?" Studies in the Anthropology of Visual Communication 2(2): 104-111.

Taylor, L. 1996. Iconophobia. Transition 69:64-88. Weinberger, E. 1992. The camera people. Transition 55:24-54

# Screening 1.

# Ongka's Big Moka. 1974 (52 mins), Charlie Nairn

Ongka is a charismatic big-man of the Kawelka tribe who live scattered in the Western highlands, north of Mount Hagen, in New Guinea. The film focuses on the motivations and efforts involved in organising a big ceremonial gift-exchange or moka planned to take place sometime in 1974. Ongka has spent nearly five years preparing for this ceremonial exchange, using all his big-man skills of oratory and persuasion in order to try to assemble what he hopes will be a huge gift of 600 pigs, some cows, some cassowaries, a motorcycle, a truck and £5,500 in cash.

#### **Recommended Reading:**

Strathern, A.J. 1971. The Rope of Moka: Big-Men and Ceremonial Exchange in Mount Hagen, New Guinea. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

#### Screening 2.

# Amir: An Afghan Refugee Musician's Life in Peshawar, Pakistan. 1985 (54 mins), John Baily.

The film investigates and portrays the life of Afghan refugees living in and around the city of Peshawar in northern Pakistan through the experiences of the musician Amir. The aspirations of Afghan refugees are expressed through their political songs dealing with the civil war in Afghanistan, with exile, with Afghan nationalism and with the Islamic revolution. In highly charged and tragic circumstances music can be used in very direct ways, both to promote solidarity and as an agent of catharsis. Amir brings that musical power to the viewer. John Baily made this film during his training as an ethnographic film-maker. He had come to know Amir earlier when carrying out ethnomusicological research in Herat between 1973 and 1977. The result is an an intimate and collaborative portrait by one musician of another. The film has a degree of reflexivity, in that Baily introduces himself early in the film, but after that it is very much Amir's story, a story of insecurity but with a strong determination to survive.

#### Recommended Reading:

Baily, John S. 2009. 'The Art of the 'Fieldwork Movie': 35 Years of Making Ethnomusicological Films. Ethnomusicology Forum, 18(1), pp. 55-64.

## Screening 3.

#### Divorce, Iranian Style. 1989 (80 mins), Kim Longinotto & Ziba Mir-Hosseini

This film is set in the Family Law Courts in central Tehran. The three main characters are Jamileh who punishes her husband for beating her, Ziba, a 16 year old girl who is trying to get a divorce from her 38 year old husband, and Maryam who is fighting for the custody of her daughters. The film moves away from portraying Iran as a country of war, hostages and Fatwas. It concentrates instead on ordinary women who come to this court to try and transform their lives.

#### Recommended Reading:

Mir-Hosseini, Z. (1999), 'The Making of Divorce Iranian Style', ISIM Newsletter 2 (1) pp. 17.

# Screening 4: Decolonising Shorts Programme

In this programme of short films you will watch three works that have been selected as part of the Royal Anthropological Institute's Decolonising collections.

# This Is A Majlis: A Sound Essay, 2020 (17 mins). Timothy P. A. Cooper & Abeera Arif-Bashir This is a visual ethnography of sound using locally-produced audio and video tapes and still photography of urban Pakistan. The film conjures the atmosphere, intimacy, and energy of the majlis-e-aza, a mourning gathering central to communal worship for Shi'a Muslims.

#### Faces/Voices. 2018 (18 mins) Paul Basu & Christopher Thomas Allen

The film complicates any simple reading of a colonial photographic archive from Southern Nigeria and Sierra Leone that was collected between 1909 and 1915. Through a collaborative creative effort with contemporary multimedia artists The Light Surgeons, voices are added to mute photographs to produce multiple readings.

#### Making Worlds Otherwise, 2020 (28 mins) Miyarrka Media.

An exuberant experiment in the ethnographic art of remix that gives new form to Miyarrka Media's project of yuta, or new, anthropology. Sound, images, colour, light, and deeply felt patterns of kinship and connection are used to draw once separate worlds into relationship. Rather than explaining Yolngu aesthetics, this work sets it alight on the screen.

#### Recommended Reading:

Grimshaw, Anna. "Does Ethnographic Film (Still) Matter? Reflections on the Genre in a World of Multimodality." *Visual Anthropology* 35.2 (2022): 120-137.

#### Suggested Supervision Topic:

Do ethnographic films give an analysis of the human processes they depict? If so, how do films' possible methods of analysis compare to the methods of analysis that are possible in ethnographic writing?

# LENT TERM

# Lecture series IV: Anthropology Now 8 lectures (Lent term, weeks 1-8)

Alongside the key concepts, theories and puzzles explored in the 'How Anthropologists think' series, and which map a history of anthropological thought, students will have a weekly lecture throughout Michaelmas term in which a range of lecturers will each tackle an issue, topic or case which is currently at the forefront of anthropological enquiry and which is close to their own research interests and expertise. This series thus presents a showcase of the distinctive insight which anthropological approaches bring to a range of key topics of concern today. Running through all these lectures is the key question of what anthropology's distinctive methodology and approach — its concern with ethnographic fieldwork, with extended description of particular cases, and with comparison in its various forms — brings to themes and topics which are of key interest to social scientists and the public more broadly.

# Lecture 1. Debating Race

Natalie Morningstar

This lecture tells the story of two key periods in which anthropologists have engaged intensively with questions of race, inequality, and science. First, it examines how early critics of evolutionism, including W. E. B. Du Bois and Franz Boas, helped unsettle claims about the scientific basis of racial difference. Second, it explores how unfinished business in this early literature has reemerged in debates about social constructivism and new genetic technologies since the 1990s. Enduring lessons and tensions anthropologists are still confronting are drawn out in light of a case study: a comparison between social conceptions of race and ancestry in the US versus Latin America.

#### Key Readings:

King, C. 2019. Gods of the Upper Air. New York: Doubleday.

Franklin, S. 2003. Re-thinking nature—culture: Anthropology and the new genetics. *Anthropological Theory*, *3*(1), 65-85.

Visweswaran, K. 1998. Race and the Culture of Anthropology. American Anthropologist, 100(1), 70-83.

Wade, P. 1993. "'Race", nature and culture'. Man 28 (1): 17-34.

#### The History of Race, Anthropology, and Social Constructivism:

Boas, F. 1911. The Mind of Primitive Man. New York: Macmillan.

Boas, F. 1974. 'Commencement Address for Atlanta University', Atlanta, University Leaflet (No. 9). In G. Stocking (ed.) A Franz Boas Reader. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Du Bois, W. E. B. 1986. 'Dusk of Dawn' and 'The Souls of Black Folk.' *In* Huggins, N. *WEB Du Bois: Writings.* New York: The Library of America.

Harrison, F. V. 1992. The Du Boisian legacy in anthropology. Critique of Anthropology, 12(3), 239-260.

#### The New Genetics:

Brodwin, P. 2002. Genetics, identity, and the anthropology of essentialism. *Anthropological Quarterly*, 75(2): 323-330.

Finkler, K. 2010. Experiencing the New Genetics: Family and Kinship on the Medical Frontier. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Hartigan Jr, J. 2008. Is race still socially constructed? The recent controversy over race and medical genetics. *Science as Culture*, 17(2): 163-193.

M'charek, A. 2005. The Human Genome Diversity Project: An Ethnography of Scientific Practice. Cambridge: University Press.

M'charek, A. 2013. Beyond fact or fiction: On the materiality of race in practice. *Cultural Anthropology*, 28(3), 420-442.

Reardon, J. & K. TallBear. 2012. "Your DNA Is Our History" Genomics, Anthropology, and the Construction of Whiteness as Property. *Current Anthropology*, 53(S5), S233-S245.

TallBear, K. 2013. Native American DNA: Tribal Belonging and the False Promise of Genetic Science. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press

#### The Case of the US and Brazil:

Kent, M., R. V. Santos & P. Wade. 2014. Negotiating imagined genetic communities: unity and diversity in Brazilian science and society. *American Anthropologist*, 116(4): 736-748.

Santos, S. A. D. 2006. Who is black in Brazil? A timely or a false question in Brazilian race relations in the era of affirmative action? *Latin American Perspectives*, 33(4): 30-48.

Santos, R. V., P. H. Fry, S. Monteiro, M. C. Maio, J. C. Rodrigues, L. Bastos-Rodrigues & M. C. Bortolini. 2009. Color, race, and genomic ancestry in Brazil: dialogues between anthropology and genetics. *Current Anthropology*, 50(6): 787-819.

Skidmore, T. E. 1993. Bi-racial USA vs. multi-racial Brazil: is the contrast still valid? *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 25(2): 373-386.

#### Lecture 2. Protest

Sian Lazar

This lecture will discuss street and social media protests, drawing especially on protests in Latin America. We will discuss some of my own ethnography as well as writing on ongoing protests. Depending on events at the time, we will discuss issues such as visual codes, embodied action, collective subjectivity, political morality, the relationship between street protest and the city, the role of social media, neoliberalism, race and gender violence.

#### Readings referenced in the lecture:

Cultural Anthropology Fieldsights series on Black Lives Matter protests, 2015: <a href="https://culanth.org/fieldsights/series/blacklivesmatter-anti-black-racism-police-violence-and-resistance">https://culanth.org/fieldsights/series/blacklivesmatter-anti-black-racism-police-violence-and-resistance</a>

Aretxaga, B. (1995). Dirty Protest: Symbolic Overdetermination and Gender in Northern Ireland Ethnic Violence. <u>Etho</u>s, 23(2), 123-148. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/640420</u>

Lazar, S (2015) 'This is not a parade, it's a protest march'. Intertextuality, citation, and political action on the streets of Bolivia and Argentina. <u>American Anthropologist</u> 117.2: 242-256 <a href="http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/aman.12227/abstract">http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/aman.12227/abstract</a>

Lazar, S (2018) 'Spontaneity, antagonism and the moral politics of outrage. Urban protest in Argentina since 2001.' in *Worldwide Mobilizations. Class Struggles and Urban Commoning* edited by Don Kalb and Mao Mollona, Berghahn Press, pp. 92-117 (pdf available on Moodle)

Bjork-James, C (2020): 'Unarmed Militancy: Tactical Victories, Subjectivity, and Legitimacy in Bolivian Street Protest' <u>American Anthropologist</u> <a href="https://anthrosource-onlinelibrary-wiley-com.ezp.lib.cam.ac.uk/doi/10.1111/aman.13382">https://anthrosource-onlinelibrary-wiley-com.ezp.lib.cam.ac.uk/doi/10.1111/aman.13382</a>

#### For dipping into:

Turner, E. (2012) Communitas. The Anthropology of Collective Joy

Durkheim, E. (1915) Elementary Forms of the Religious Life (search 'effervescence' and read around that)

Thompson, E.P. (1971) The Moral economy of the English Crowd in the Eighteenth Century. <u>Past & Present</u> 50, 76-136

#### Further reading:

Camthropod episode 6. Sounds of Protest, by Sian Lazar. <a href="https://www.socanth.cam.ac.uk/media/listen-and-view/camthropod#episode-6--sounds-of-protest-by-sian-lazar">https://www.socanth.cam.ac.uk/media/listen-and-view/camthropod#episode-6--sounds-of-protest-by-sian-lazar</a>

Collins, J. (2012). "Theorizing Wisconsin's 2011 protests: Community-based unionism confronts accumulation by dispossession." American Ethnologist **39**(1): 6-20.

Graeber, D. 2015 Ferguson and the Criminalization of American Life, Gawker: https://gawker.com/ferguson-and-the-criminalization-of-american-life-1692392051

Juris, J. S. (2012). "Reflections on #Occupy Everywhere: Social media, public space, and emerging logics of aggregation." American Ethnologist 39(2): 259-279.

Lazar, S. (2014). "Historical narrative, mundane political time, and revolutionary moments: coexisting temporalities in the lived experience of social movements." <u>Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute</u> **20**: 91-108.

Lazar, S., Ed. (2017). Where are the unions? Workers and Social Movements in Latin America, the Middle East, and Europe. London, Zed Books.

Razsa, M. and A. Kurnik (2012). "The Occupy Movement in Žižek's hometown: Direct democracy and a politics of becoming." <u>American Ethnologist</u> **39**(2): 238-258.

Taussig, M. (2013). I'm so angry I made a sign. Occupy: Three Inquiries in Disobedience. W. J. T. Mitchell, B. E. Harcourt and M. Taussig. Chicago, University of Chicago Press: 3-43.

Werbner, P., et al., Eds. (2014). <u>The political aesthetics of global protest</u>. The arab spring and beyond. Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press.

Werbner, P. (2014). <u>The Making of an African Working Class: Politics, Law, and Cultural Protest in the Manual Workers Union of Botswana</u>. London, Pluto Press.

# Lecture 3. Truth, disinformation, and conspiracy on the internet Sian Lazar

In this lecture, we will ask how – if at all - can older anthropological debates help us to understand contemporary problems of misinformation/disinformation on the internet? Is 'misinformation' in fact a problem for the internet today? What are the political consequences of the ways that digital media operate? And what happens if we decentre the US experience and focus on misinformation in other contexts?

I strongly recommend that you watch:

The Social Dilemma (on Netflix)

David Bowie on the power of the internet, from 1999 <a href="https://youtu.be/tLf6KZmJyrA">https://youtu.be/tLf6KZmJyrA</a>

#### Readings

Cesarino, L. (2020). "HOW SOCIAL MEDIA AFFORDS POPULIST POLITICS: REMARKS ON LIMINALITY BASED ON THE BRAZILIAN CASE". Trabalhos Em Linguística Aplicada, vol. 59, no. 1, UNICAMP. pp. 404–27, https://www.scielo.br/j/tla/a/Jbzm34pcQh78Wq4TpLdrQfP/?lang=en. ALSO a shorter blog post for POLAR: On Digital Populism in Brazil https://polarjournal.org/2019/04/15/on-jair-bolsonaros-digital-populism/

Drążkiewicz, E. and Rabo, A. (2021). Conspiracy Theories. In The International Encyclopedia of Anthropology (eds H. Callan and S. Coleman). <a href="https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118924396.wbiea2449">https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118924396.wbiea2449</a> Hayden, C. (2021), From connection to contagion. JRAI, 27: 95-107. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9655.13482">https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9655.13482</a>

La Fontaine J. <u>Speak of the Devil: Tales of Satanic Abuse in Contemporary England</u>. Cambridge University Press; 1998. <u>https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/speak-of-the-devil/546C2517E96864DAB1616D35BD56CE00</u>

Liston, N. M. (2020). The Truth Society: Science, Disinformation, and Politics in Berlusconi's Italy. United States: Cornell University Press. CHAPTER 3

Rakopoulos, T 2022. Of fascists and dreamers: Conspiracy theory and Anthropology. *Social Anthopology* 30(1): 45-62. <a href="https://www.berghahnjournals.com/view/journals/saas/30/1/saas300104.xml">https://www.berghahnjournals.com/view/journals/saas/30/1/saas300104.xml</a> Sampson, Steven. 2021. "Cabal Anthropology – or whether the anthropology of belief helps us understand conspiracism." FocaalBlog, 13 September. <a href="https://www.focaalblog.com/2021/09/13/steven-sampson-cabal-anthropology">https://www.focaalblog.com/2021/09/13/steven-sampson-cabal-anthropology</a>

Sharma, A (2023) Political mobilisation in an era of 'post-truth politics': Disinformation and the Hindu right in India (1980s-2010s), in eds. R Pinheiro-Machado and T Vargas-Maia <u>The Rise of the Radical Right in the Global South</u> Routledge

Udupa, S et al (2021) <u>Digital Hate.</u> <u>The Global Conjuncture of Extreme Speech</u> – chapters 2, 5, 6, 11 LIMN Issue no. 2: Crowds and Clouds <a href="https://limn.it/issues/crowds-and-clouds/">https://limn.it/issues/crowds-and-clouds/</a> Article by Maria Vidart-Delgado, on 2010 Colombian election. The other articles will also be interesting for further reading.

#### Covid Conspiracy Theories

Elisa J. Sobo and Elizbieta Drążkiewicz 2021 'Rights, responsibilities and revelations: COVID-19 conspiracy theories and the state' in <u>Viral Loads</u>. Anthropologies of urgency in the time of COVID-19 Edited by Lenore Manderson, Nancy J. Burke and Ayo Wahlberg <a href="https://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/id/eprint/10133562/1/Viral-Loads.pdf">https://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/id/eprint/10133562/1/Viral-Loads.pdf</a>

Michael Butter and Peter Knight, eds. (2023) Covid Conspiracy Theories in Global Perspective. <a href="https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003330769">https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003330769</a>. <a href="https://www.routledge.com/Covid-Conspiracy-Theories-in-Global-Perspective/Butter-Knight/p/book/9781032359434">https://www.routledge.com/Covid-Conspiracy-Theories-in-Global-Perspective/Butter-Knight/p/book/9781032359434</a>

#### The US

FT Podcast: Hot Money – Porn, Power and Profit. Series 1 Episode 4. <a href="https://www.ft.com/content/762e4648-06d7-4abd-8d1e-ccefb74b3244">https://www.ft.com/content/762e4648-06d7-4abd-8d1e-ccefb74b3244</a>

Lepselter, S (2016) <u>The Resonance of Unseen Things. Poetics</u>, power, <u>Captivity</u>, and <u>UFOs in the American Uncanny</u>.

Waco: American Apocalypse (on Netflix)

The Coming Storm podcast on BBC Sounds

Laterza, V. (2021). Could Cambridge Analytica Have Delivered Donald Trump's 2016 Presidential Victory? An Anthropologist's Look at Big Data and Political Campaigning, Public Anthropologist, 3(1), 119-147. doi: https://doi.org/10.1163/25891715-03010007

McIntosh, J 2022 The sinister signs of QAnon: Interpretive agency and paranoid truths in alt-right oracles *Anthropology Today*. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8322.12697">https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8322.12697</a>

Ball, J (2023) The Other Pandemic. How Qanon Contaminated the World. Chapters 1-5

Phillips and Milner (2021). <u>You Are Here. A Field Guid for Polarized Speech, Conspiracy Theories, and Our Polluted Media Landscape</u>. Especially Chapter 4.

#### Press articles on aspects of internet disinformation and trolling

https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2023/feb/17/gender-trolling-women-rights-money-digital-platforms-social-media-hate-politics

https://www.revistaanfibia.com/revolucion-federal-que-tengan-miedo-de-ser-kirchneristas/ (in Spanish)

BBC News - Three clues to Russian propaganda on TikTok <a href="https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-67729077">https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-67729077</a> (December 2023) And an earlier piece from The Guardian (March 2022) <a href="https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2022/mar/19/tiktok-ukraine-russia-war-disinformation">https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2022/mar/19/tiktok-ukraine-russia-war-disinformation</a>

# Lecture 4. Infrastructure Michael Degani

A pipeline bursts; soldiers demand payment at a security checkpoint; a secretary puts you on hold. For anthropologists, infrastructures are empirical objects worthy of study (built systems that facilitate movement—or storage—of people and things), and sometimes even a kind of analytical lens in their own right ('grounds' that give rise to 'figures'). Rooted in histories of capitalism, imperialism and development, their accelerating growth and decay in the Anthropocene has stirred an array of anthropological reflections on the nature of collective life. While we may think of infrastructures as tacit or invisible, we will find that they are often highly visible or otherwise sensed. If we think of them as stable or subtending, we will discover them to be complex and ever-shifting ecologies of people, artifacts, materials, and events. Finally, whereas we may think of infrastructures as politically neutral, we will come to see how they are intimately bound up in questions of justice, belonging, suffering, and aspiration.

# **Key Ethnographic Readings**

Schwenkel, Christina. 2015. "Spectacular Infrastructure and Its Breakdown in Socialist Vietnam." American Ethnologist 42 (3): 520–34.

Elyachar, Julia. 2010. "Phatic Labor, Infrastructure, and the Question of Empowerment in Cairo." *American Ethnologist* 37 (3): 452–64.

Muehlebach, Andrea. 2018. "Commonwealth: On Democracy and Dispossession in Italy." *History and Anthropology* 29 (3): 342-358.

Redfield, Peter. 2016. "Fluid Technologies: The Bush Pump, the LifeStraw ® and Microworlds of Humanitarian Design." *Social Studies of Science* 46 (2): 159–83.

Bear, Laura. 2020. "Speculations on Infrastructure: From Colonial Public Works to a Post-Colonial Global Asset Class on the Indian railways 1840–2017." *Economy and Society* 49: 45-70

Nguyen, Vinh-Kim. 2019. "Of What are Epidemics the Symptom?: Speed, Interlinkage, and Infrastructure in Molecular Anthropology." In *The Anthropology of Epidemics*, edited by Anne H. Kelly, Fredrick Keck. And Chyrston Lynteris, 154-177. Routledge.

#### Overviews

Star, Susan Leigh. 1999. "The Ethnography of Infrastructure." American Behavioral Scientist 43 (3): 377-391.

Larkin, Brian. 2013. "The Politics and Poetics of Infrastructure." Annual Review of Anthropology 42 (1): 327–43.

Carse, Ashley. 2016. "Keyword: Infrastructure: How a Humble French Engineer- ing Term Shaped the Modern World." In *Infrastructures and Social Complexity*, edited by Penny Harvey, Casper Bruun Jensen, and Atsuro Morita, 45–57. Routledge.

Edwards, Paul N. 2003. "Infrastructure and Modernity: Force, Time, and Social Organization in the History of Sociotechnical Systems." In Modernity and Technology, edited by Andrew Feenberg, Philip Brey, and Thomas J. Misa, 185–225, MIT Press.

# Concept work

Simone, AbdouMaliq. 2004 "People as Infrastructure: Intersecting fragments in Johannesburg." *Public Culture* 16 (3): 407-429.

Ballestero, Andrea. 2019. "The Underground as Infrastructure? Water, Figure/Ground Reversals, and Dissolution in Sardinal." In *Infrastructure, Environment, and Life in the Anthropocene*, edited by Kregg Hetherington, 17-44. Duke University Press.

Carse, Ashley. 2012. "Nature as Infrastructure: Making and managing the Panama Canal Watershed." *Social Studies of Science* 42 (4): 539-563.

Venkatesan, Soumhya, Laura Bear, Penny Harvey, Sian Lazar, Laura Rival, and AbdouMaliq Simone. 2018. "Attention to infrastructure offers a welcome reconfiguration of anthropological approaches to the political." *Critique of Anthropology* 38 (1): 3-52.

Jensen, Casper Bruun, and Atsuro Morita. 2017. "Introduction: Infrastructures as Ontological Experiments." *Ethnos* 82 (4): 615-626.

Anusas, Mike, and Tim Ingold. 2015. "The Charge Against Electricity." *Cultural Anthropology* 30 (4): 540-554.

#### Further Reading

Gershon, Ilana. 2010. "Breaking Up Is Hard To Do: Media Switching and Media Ideologies." *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology* 20 (2): 389–405.

Appel, Hannah. 2014. "Walls and White Elephants: Oil, Infrastructure, and the Materiality of Citizenship in Urban Equatorial Guinea." In *The Arts of Citizenship in African Cities*, edited by Rosalind Fredericks and Mamadou Diof, 253-276. Palgrave Macmillan.

Adunbi, Omolade. 2020. "Crafting Spaces of Value: Infrastructure, Technologies of Extraction and Contested oil in Nigeria." *The Cambridge Journal of Anthropology* 38 (2): 38-52.

Bowker, Geoffrey C., and Susan Leigh Star. 2000. "Invisible Mediators of Action: Classification and the Ubiquity of Standards." *Mind, Culture, and Activity* 7 (1-2): 147-163.

#### Sample Essay Questions

What are the (political, ethical, conceptual) implications of theorizing people "as" infrastructure? Or nature "as" infrastructure?

How does connection (or lack thereof) to infrastructural networks mediate sociopoltical relations and vice-versa?

Describe the (environmental, sensory, social, etc.) effects of financialization and commercialization of public infrastructures since the 1980s.

#### Lecture 5. Complicating Conservation

Liana Chua

As climate change and mass extinction radically reshape the planet, calls to 'do something' to 'save the environment' have grown louder and ever more urgent. But what do 'doing something' and 'saving' actually involve? How are such interventions designed, who gets to shape and run them, and what are their effects on the ground? In this lecture, we'll take a critical look at the sprawling, influential, yet often highly problematic global industry of biodiversity conservation, which is built around that urge to 'save the environment'. Thinking through my colleagues' and my ongoing research on orangutan conservation, we'll ask what anthropological methods, perspectives and insights can bring to our understandings of conservation as a global phenomenon – particularly its ethics and practices.

#### Suggested essay questions:

What can ethnographic methods and insights bring to our understanding of biodiversity conservation?

 'Nature is not political'. Critically discuss this claim with reference to at least two of the readings listed below.

#### Core ethnographic case study:

Chua, L., H. Fair, V. Scheer, A. Stępień and P.H. Thung. 2021. "Only the orangutans get a life jacket": uncommoning responsibility in a global conservation nexus'. *American Ethnologist* 48 (4): 370-385. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/amet.13045">https://doi.org/10.1111/amet.13045</a>

#### Further reading: ethnographies of conservation/ists

Adams, W.M. 2004. *Against Extinction: The Story of Conservation*. London: Earthscan. – A useful account of conservation's development and key ideas over a century.

Bocci, P. 2017. 'Tangles of Care: Killing Goats to Save Tortoises on the Galápagos Islands'. *Cultural Anthropology* 32: 424-449. <a href="https://doi.org/10.14506/ca32.3.08">https://doi.org/10.14506/ca32.3.08</a>

Jalais, A. 2010. Forest of Tigers: People, Politics and Environment in the Sundarbans. London: Routledge. Keller, E. 2015. Beyond the Lens of Conservation: Malagasy and Swiss Imaginations of One Another. Oxford: Berghahn.

Kiik, L. 2019. 'Conservationland: Toward the Anthropology of Professionals in Global Nature Conservation'. *Critique of Anthropology* 39 (4): 391–419.

Lowe, Celia. 2006. Wild Profusion: Biodiversity Conservation in an Indonesian Archipelago. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Margulies, J.D. 2019. 'Making the "Man-eater": Tiger Conservation as Necropolitics'. *Political Geography* 69: 150-161.

Münster, U. 2016. 'Working for the Forest: The Ambivalent Intimacies of Humans and Elephants in South Indian Wildlife Conservation'. *Ethnos: Journal of Anthropology* 81 (3): 425-47.

Palmer, A. 2020. Ethical Debates in Orangutan Conservation. London: Routledge.

Smith, W. 2020. 'Beyond Loving Nature: Affective Conservation and Human-pig Violence in the Philippines'. *Ethnos* DOI: 10.1080/00141844.2020.1828970

West, P. 2006. Conservation is Our Government Now: The Politics of Ecology in Papua New Guinea. Durham: Duke University Press.

# Further reading: Critiques and alternative visions of conservation

Note: Not all of these are anthropological writings, but then this is a pretty multidisciplinary conversation! When reading non-anthropological work, always ask yourself how it differs from what you've been learning in SAN1 and what anthropological methods and analysis might bring to it.

Aini, J. and P. West. 2018. Two keynotes on 'Decolonizing Conservation'. Full text available at <a href="https://paige-west.com/2018/07/28/decolonizing-conservation/">https://paige-west.com/2018/07/28/decolonizing-conservation/</a>. – Cultural Anthropology Büscher, B. and R. Fletcher. (2020). *The Conservation Revolution: Radical Ideas for Saving Nature beyond the Anthropocene*. London: Verso Books. – Political Ecology

Collins, Y. A. & Maguire-Rajpaul, V. & Krauss, J. E. & Asiyanbi, A. & Jiménez, A. & Mabele, M. B. & Alexander-Owen, M., 2021. 'Plotting the Coloniality of Conservation'. *Journal of Political Ecology* 28(1). <a href="https://doi.org/10.2458/jpe.4683">https://doi.org/10.2458/jpe.4683</a> - Political Ecology/Geography

Kashwan P, V. Duffy R, Massé F, Asiyanbi, AP & Marijnen E. 2021. 'From racialized neocolonial global conservation to an inclusive and regenerative conservation'. *Environment: Science and Policy for Sustainable Development*, 63(4), 4-19. <a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00139157.2021.1924574">http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00139157.2021.1924574</a> – Political Ecology Massarella, K., J. Krauss, W. Kiwango, and R. Fletcher, eds. 2022. 'Exploring Convivial Conservation in Theory and Practice' Special issue of *Conservation and Society* 20(2). – Political Ecology/Geography Pooley, Simon. 2021. 'Coexistence for Whom?'. *Frontiers in Conservation Science* 28 September 2021. <a href="https://doi.org/10.3389/fcosc.2021.726991">https://doi.org/10.3389/fcosc.2021.726991</a> - Geography

#### Lecture 6. Pandemics and the stories we tell

Kelly Fagan Robinson

Pandemics can offer "a window on the underlying structures of social relationship within and across group boundaries, including the mechanisms used to sustain complex social architectures of inequality over time" (Singer 2009). Through reflecting on the formal structures of communication resources employed during recent pandemics - diagrams, animations, social media posts, news bulletins and others - this lecture will

map out the ways that semiotic abstractions can have fleshy real-world impacts on human connectivity, inclusions, and exclusions. It will foreground the role that anthropologists have played and continue to play in understanding who 'we' are in the stories we tell as we navigate global health crises.

Don't feel daunted by the length of the reading list below! I have included a very long list, partly in order to give you starting points for exploring a range of different pandemics. Consider the following two questions as you read: How does the positionality of the researcher/author affect the narration of pandemic sociality? How does temporality affect the message received and resulting forms of knowledge? Consider your own experiences of the last twenty months.

#### TEXTS (Key Readings)

Singer, Merrill. "Pathogens gone wild? medical anthropology and the "swine flu" pandemic." *Medical Anthropology* 28, no. 3 (2009): 199-206.

Lynteris, Christos. "The prophetic faculty of epidemic photography: Chinese wet markets and the imagination of the next pandemic." *Visual Anthropology* 29, no. 2 (2016): 118-132.

Briggs, Charles L., and Mark Nichter. "Biocommunicability and the biopolitics of pandemic threats." *Medical anthropology* 28, no. 3 (2009): 189-198.

Bear, Laura, Nikita Simpson, Caroline Bazambanza, Rebecca Bowers, Atiya Kamal, Anishka Gheewala Lohiya, Alice Pearson, Jordan Vieira, Connor Watt, and Milena Wuerth. "Social infrastructures for the post-Covid recovery in the UK." (2021).

#### **FILMS**

"The Story of Ebola" https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=\_iT7Rrb4wqs (Global Health Media Project with International Federation of Red Cross, Red Crescent Societies, UNICEF, & Yoni Goodman)

"What is a coronavirus and what should you do?" Lesson: Elizabeth Cox, director: Anton Bogaty. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D9tTi-CDjDU

# Recommended Further Reading:

Kelly, Ann H., Frédéric Keck, and Christos Lynteris, eds. The anthropology of epidemics. Routledge, 2019.

Abramowitz, Sharon. "Epidemics (Especially Ebola)." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 46 (2017):421-445.7-31.

Biehl, João. "Theorizing global health." Medicine Anthropology Theory 3, no. 2 (2016): 127-142.

Nguyen, Vihn-Kim and Karine Peschard. 2003. "Anthropology, Inequality, and Disease: A Review." Annual Review of Anthropology 32:447-474

Butt, Leslie. "The suffering stranger: Medical anthropology and international morality." *Medical Anthropology* 21, no. 1 (2002):1-24.

Martineau, Fred, Annie Wilkinson, and Melissa Parker. "Epistemologies of Ebola: reflections on the experience of the Ebola Response Anthropology Platform." *Anthropological Quarterly* 90, no. 2 (2017)

#### More on Pandemics

Stellmach, Darryl, Isabel Beshar, Juliet Bedford, Philipp Du Cros, and Beverley Stringer. "Anthropology in public health emergencies: what is anthropology good for?." *BMJ global health* 3, no. 2 (2018).

Lynteris, Christos. "Introduction: Infectious Animals and Epidemic Blame." *In Framing Animals as Epidemic Villains*, pp. 1-25. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, 2019.

Lynteris, Christos. "The epidemiologist as culture hero: Visualizing humanity in the age of "the next pandemic"." *Visual Anthropology* 29, no. 1 (2016): 36-53

Shore, Cris, and Susan Wright. "Governing by numbers: audit culture, rankings and the new world order." *Social Anthropology* 23, no. 1 (2015): 22-28.

#### Disease-specific discourses

#### COVID19

Levine, Susan, and Lenore Manderson. "Proxemics, COVID-19, and the Ethics of Care in South Africa." *Cultural Anthropology* 36, no. 3 (2021): 391-399.

Das, Veena. 2020. "Facing Covid-19: My Land of Neither Hope nor Despair." In "Covid-19 and Student Focused Concerns: Threats and Possibilities," Veena Das and Naveeda Khan, eds., *American Ethnologist website*, May 1 2020

"The Coronavirus Explained & What You Should Do" <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BtN-goy9VOY">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BtN-goy9VOY</a> (Kurzgesagt – In a Nutshell)

http://www.medanthro.net/announcing-issue-3-of-medical-anthropology-weekly-covid-19/

#### Ebola

Fairhead, James. "Understanding social resistance to the Ebola response in the Forest Region of the Republic of Guinea: an anthropological perspective." African Studies Review 59, no. 3 (2016)

Sáez, A. Marí, Ann Kelly, and Hannah Brown. "Notes from Case Zero: Anthropology in the time of Ebola." Somatosphere: Science, Medicine, and Anthropology 3 (2014).

Manguvo, Angellar, and Benford Mafuvadze. "The impact of traditional and religious practices on the spread of Ebola in West Africa: time for a strategic shift." *The Pan African Medical Journal* 22, no. Suppl 1 (2015).

Whitty, Christopher JM. "The contribution of biological, mathematical, clinical, engineering and social sciences to combatting the West African Ebola epidemic." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 372, no. 1721 (2017): 20160293.

Mitman, Gregg, and Paul Erickson. "Latex and blood: Science, markets, and American empire." Radical History Review 2010, no. 107 (2010): 45-73

Biruk, Crystal. "Ebola and emergency anthropology: The view from the 'global health slot'." *Somatosphere: Science, Medicine, and Anthropology* 3 (2014).

"In the Shadow of Ebola" (shortened version) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=y5z3Rb8YBC8

#### Zika

Socorro Veloso de Albuquerque, Maria do, Sandra Valongueiro Alves, Thália Velho Barreto de Araújo, Kevin Bardosh, Priscilla Bennett, Mercy J. Borbor-Cordova, Roberto Briceño-León et al. "Locating Zika: Social Change and Governance in an Ahe of Mosquito Pandemics." (2019): 238.

#### HIV/AIDS

Farmer, Paul. "Sending sickness: sorcery, politics, and changing concepts of AIDS in rural Haiti." *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 4, no. 1 (1990): 6-27.

#### Structural Violence

Farmer, Paul, Philippe Bourgois, Didier Fassin, Linda Green, H. K. Heggenhougen, Laurence Kirmayer, Loc Wacquant, and Paul Farmer. "An anthropology of structural violence." *Current anthropology* 45, no. 3 (2004): 305-325.

Auyero, Javier, Philippe Bourgois, and Nancy Scheper-Hughes, eds. *Violence at the urban margins*. Oxford University Press, 2015.

#### **Supervision Questions:**

Looking back at the Covid19 pandemic what might refute narratives suggesting we have broken with the past and created a "new normal?"

What role do human and/or non-human animal villains play in pandemic discourses?

Charles Briggs has argued that pandemics are "not unprecedented in being as much "communicative" as "medical." Discuss.

# Lecture 7. Gossip

Priscilla Garcia

This lecture begins with the premise that there are many ways to study gossip, and there are many ways people in different places conceptualise and experience it. Hence, the title: *Anthropologies of gossip*. These lectures are divided into three parts. The first discusses the initial studies of gossip in social anthropology and focuses on the foundational debate on gossip led by anthropologists Max Gluckman and Robert Paine in the 1960s. Then, we will discuss the several ethnographic and theoretical approaches to gossip that have emerged since the 1970s, from functionalist to transactionalist to linguistic and performative theories of cultural competence, linking gossip with the development and history of anthropological theory. We will also discuss gossip through classic Marxist notions of resistance to more recent approaches to gossip as "everyday politics", probing into the interfaces of language (conversation) and power and its interface with gender, the economy, migration, and other forms of human experience. In examining these different theoretical approaches and ethnographic contexts, we will reflect on whether gossip is a mechanism of social control, a form of resistance, a way to acquire individual power and authority, and a practice to establish networks and exclude outsiders while problematising the very establishment of these theoretical borders, developments and definitions.

#### Reading List

#### 1. Background reading

Besnier, N. (2019). "Gossip in Ethnographic Perspective", in Francesca Giardini, and Rafael Wittek (eds), The Oxford Handbook of Gossip and Reputation, Oxford Handbooks, ebook.

Brenneis, D. (1992). "Gossip", in Richard Bauman (ed), Folklore, Cultural Performances, and Popular Entertainments: A Communications-centered Handbook. Oxford: University of Oxford Press.

# 2. Theoretical Development I: The Gluckman-Paine Debate

Gluckman, M. (1963) Papers in Honor of Melville J. Herskovits: Gossip and Scandal, *Current Anthropology*, 4(3), 307-316.

Gluckman, M. (1968). Psychological, Sociological and Anthropological Explanations of Witchcraft and Gossip: A Clarification. *Man*, 3(1), 20–34.

Paine, R. (1967). What is Gossip About? An Alternative Hypothesis. Man, 2(2), 278-285.

Paine, R. (1968). Gossip and Transaction. Man, 3(2), 305–308.

# 3. Theoretical Development II: The Aftermath of the Gluckman-Paine Debate and the New Approaches to Gossip

Abrahams, R. D. (1970). A Performance-centred approach to gossip. Man, 5(2), 290-301.

Besnier, N. (1989). Information withholding as a manipulative and collusive strategy in Nukulaelae gossip. *Language in Society*, 18(3), 315–341.

Brenneis, D. (1984). Grog and gossip in Bhatgaon: Style and substance in Fiji Indian conversation. *American Ethnologist*, 11(3), 487-506.

Cox, B. A. (1970). What is Hopi gossip about? Information management and Hopi factions. *Man*, 5(1), 88-98.

Bailey, F. G. (1971). Gifts and poisons: the politics of reputation. Oxford: Blackwell.

Goodwin, M. H. (1980). He-said-she-said: Formal cultural procedures for the construction of a gossip dispute. *American Ethnologist* 7: 674–95.

Handelman, D. (1973). Gossip in encounters: The transmission of information in a bounded social setting. *Man*, 8(2), 210-227.

Hannerz, U. (1967). Gossip, networks and culture in a black American ghetto. Ethnos, 32(1-4), 35-60.

Haviland, J.B. (1977). Gossip, Reputation, and Knowledge in Zinacantan. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Heilman, S. C. (2017[1976]). "Gossip", in Synagogue life: A study in symbolic interaction. Routledge. p.151-192

Merry, S. E. (1984). Rethinking gossip and scandal, in Donald Black (ed), Toward a general theory of social control (vol. 1: fundamentals). Orlando: Academic Press Inc.

Szwed, J. F. (1966). Gossip, Drinking, and Social Control: Consensus and Communication in a Newfoundland Parish. Ethnology, 5(4), 434–441.

Wilson, P. (1974). Filcher of Good Names: An Enquiry into Anthropology and Gossip. Man, 9(1), 93-102.

# 4. New Horizons: Gossip, Ethnographic Comparison, and the Multifaceted Dimensions of Power (from 1990s to present)

Andreassen, R. (1998). Gossip in Henningsvær. Etnofoor, 11(2), 41–56.

Brennan, D. (2004). Women Work, Men Sponge, and Everyone Gossips: Macho Men and Stigmatized/ing Women in a Sex Tourist Town. *Anthropological Quarterly*, 77(4), 705–733.

Besnier, N. (2009). Gossip and the Everyday Production of Politics. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.

Brison, K. J. (1992). Just talk gossip, meetings, and power in a Papua New Guinea village. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Drążkiewicz, E. (2020). Gossip in the Aid Industry. Anthropology News, 61(1), 22–26.

Drotbohm, H. (2010). Gossip and social control across the seas: targeting gender, resource inequalities and support in Cape Verdean transnational families. *African and Black Diaspora*, 3(1), 51–68.

Geertz, A. W. (2011). Hopi Indian Witchcraft and Healing: On Good, Evil, and Gossip. *American Indian Quarterly*, 35(3), 372–393.

Haviland, J. B. (1998). Mu'nuk jbankil to, mu'nuk kajvaltik: "He is not my older brother, he is not Our Lord": Thirty years of gossip in a Chiapas village. *Etnofoor*, 11(2), 57–82.

Paz, A. (2009). The Circulation of Chisme and Rumor: Gossip, Evidentiality, and Authority in the Perspective of Latino Labor Migrants in Israel. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*, 19(1), 117-143.

Pietila, Tuulikki (2007). Gossip, Markets, and Gender: How Dialogue Constructs Moral Value in Post-socialist Kilimanjaro. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

Raj, J. (2019). Rumour and gossip in a time of crisis: Resistance and accommodation in a South Indian plantation frontier. *Critique of Anthropology*, 39(1), 52–73

Schieffelin, B. B. (2008). Speaking Only Your Own Mind: Reflections on Talk, Gossip and Intentionality in Bosavi (PNG). *Anthropological Quarterly*, 81(2), 431–441.

Stewart, P. J., & Strathern, Andrew. (2004). Witchcraft, sorcery, rumors, and gossip. Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press.

van Vleet, K. (2003). Partial Theories: On Gossip, Envy and Ethnography in the Andes. *Ethnography*, 4(4), 491–519.

#### **Further Reading**

Bleek, W. (1976). Witchcraft, Gossip and Death: A Social Drama. Man, 11(4), 526-541.

Coupland, J., ed. (2000). Small talk. Harlow: Longman.

Elias, N., & Scotson, J. (1965). The established and the outsiders: A sociological enquiry into community problems. London: F. Cass

Epstein, A.L. (1969) "Gossip, norms and social network", in J. Clyde Mitchell (ed.) *Social Networks in Urban Situations*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Firth, R. (1956) Rumor in a primitive society. The Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, Vol 53(1), Jul 1956, 122-132.

Gal, S. (2016[1989]). Language and political economy. HAU Journal of Ethnographic Theory, 6(3), 331-335.

Irvine, J. (1989). When talk isn't cheap: Language and political economy. American Ethnologist, 16(2), 248-267.

Kulick, D. (1996). Causing a Commotion: Public Scandal as Resistance Among Brazilian Transgendered Prostitutes. *Anthropology Today*, 12(6), 3–7.

Abu-Lughod, L. (2016[1986]). Veiled Sentiments. University of California Press.

Mitchell, J. (1974). Social Networks. Annual Review of Anthropology, 3(1), 279-299.

Scott, James. (1985) Weapons of the Weak. Everyday forms of peasant resistance. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Scott, J. (1990). Domination and the arts of resistance: Hidden transcripts. New Haven: Yale University Press.

#### Suggested supervision questions:

- 1. Why is the study of gossip important for anthropology?
- 2. Which is a more appropriate definition for gossip: a collective mechanism of social control or an individual manipulation/reputation-building strategy?
- 3. Gossip is not about resistance. Discuss.
- 4. Which is more important: what is said through gossip or who says it?

# Lecture 8. Witchcraft as politics

Joe Ellis

This lecture will introduce students to a range of ethnographies which show how practices that have been called 'witchcraft, spirit possession & shamanism' might be thought as forms of political discourse/action rather than 'traditional remnants'. The lecture will show how this shift is a key moment in the development of the theoretical canon and invite students to rethink the bounds of what 'politics' might be.

#### **Key Readings**

Boddy, J. (1988). Spirits and Selves in North Sudan: The Cultural Therapeutics of Possession and Trance. *American Ethnologist.* 15 (1). 4-27

Buyandelger, M. (2007). Dealing with Uncertainty: Shamans, Marginal Capitalism and the Remaking of History in Postsocialist Mongolia. *American Ethnologist.* 34. 127-147

Comaroff, J.& Comaroff, J. (1998). Occult Economies and the Violence of Abstraction: Notes from the South African Postcolony. *American Ethnologist. 26 (2).* 279-303

# **Further Readings**

Chakrabarty, D. (2000). Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference. New Jersey: Princeton

Evans-Pritchard, E. E. (1976) Witchcraft, oracles, and magic among the Azande. Oxford: Clarendon Press. *Particularly chapters 2, 4 & 9.* 

Graeber, D. (2015). Radical Alterity is Just Another Way to Say 'Reality': Reply to Eduardo Viveiros de Castro. Han: Journal of Ethnographic Theory 5 (2). 1-41

Holbraad, M., Pedersen, M. A. & Viveiros des Castro, E. (2014). The Politics of Ontology: Anthropological Positions. *Cultural Anthropology Website. https://culanth.org/fieldsights/462-the-politics-of-ontology-anthropological-positions* 

Kapferer, B., Eriksen, A. & Telle, K. (2010). Religiosities toward a Future: In Pursuit of the New Millennium. *Social Analysis*. 53 (1). 1-16

Pedersen, M. A. (2011). Not Quite Shamans: Spirit Worlds and Political Lives in Northern Mongolia. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Tambiah, S. J. (1990). Magic, science, religion, and the scope of rationality. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Viveiros de Castro, E. (2014). Who is Afraid of the Ontological Wolf? *The Cambridge Journal of Anthropology*. 33 (1) 2-17

# Example supervision topic 1:

'It is impossible to study a natural disaster through ethnographic methods.' Discuss.

Readings:

Adriana Petryna, 2013. Life Exposed: Biological Citizenship After Chernobyl. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Kath Weston, 2017. Animate Planet: Making Visceral Sense of Living in a High-Tech Ecologically Damaged World. Durham: Duke University Press.

Anne Allison, 2016. "Reflections on Welfare from Postnuclear Fukushima." South Atlantic Quarterly

Vincanne Adams, 2013. Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith: New Orleans in the Wake of Katrina. Durham: Duke University Press.

Kim Fortun, 2001. Advocacy After Bhopal: Environmentalism, Disaster, New Global Orders. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Anna Lowenhaupt Tsing, Nils Bubandt, Elaine Gan, Heather Ann Swanson, ed. 2017. Arts of Living on a Damaged World. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

# Example supervision topic 2:

How do human-human relationships matter in anthropological understanding of human-animal relationships?

Readings – see reading list for lecture 7 above.

Recommended reading strategy: Read Samantha Hurn (starred above) and then select 3-5 of the other texts. Consider what sorts of comparisons are drawn out within the ethnographies. For example, look out for the way authors highlight differences, or similarities, between humans and animals, between some humans and other humans, between anthropologist and interlocutors, or between anthropology and other disciplines.

# Lecture series V. Kinship, Love and Care Perveez Mody (Lent Term, weeks 1-4)

This lecture series looks at the anthropological study of kinship and examines the ways in which anthropologists have sought to understand the structures, meanings and processes that make it an integral feature of everyday life in all societies in the world. Central to anthropological work on kinship are the ways in which it addresses some of the most pervasive concerns of our lives – our social constellations, our bodily well-being, our relations with those we regard as kin, our loves and our cares brought into being through anthropological study focussed on concrete ethnographic settings. The first pair of lectures in this four-part series introduce you to theories of kinship and anthropological theories of gender and explore their generative aspects for analysing social relations. I begin by focusing on developments in the past few decades to shed light on the changes in kinship theories borne of a reappraisal of models of the past, followed by an assessment of how kinship shaped the anthropological study of gender. The second pair of lectures focus on the more subjective meanings and content of relationships, seeking to understand the constitutive forces of kinship. Both love and care are subjects of increasing and intense anthropological interest and encourage a view of kinship as a process that is intersubjectively shaped by the societies, relationships and exchanges that come to matter.

# Lecture 1. Kinship

This lecture looks at the anthropological study of kinship and asks why kinship is at the core of the discipline? It will question what kinship is and why anthropologists have been so interested in it as an organising principle of society. Centrally, it will address debates about the distinction between "biological" and "social" kinship and between "kinship" & "family". Using Kath Weston's now iconic account (1991) Families we choose: Lesbians, Gays, Kinship, this lecture considers the processes through which kin are given and made. Finally, we will look at the ways in which the advent of new possibilities to make kin (for example, through transnational capitalism, child adoptions or making babies through IVF technologies) have generated anthropological insights into the ways in which kinship (alongside race, class & gender) connects with other phenomenon such as capitalism, the state or technology.

- What makes kinship and how are people related?
- Is kinship about normative categories and roles or everyday relations, processes and change?

Weston, Kath 1991. Families We Choose: lesbians, gays, kinship. New York and Oxford: Columbia University Press

Das, Veena 1976 "Masks & Faces: An Essay on Punjabi Kinship" in *Contributions to Indian Sociology* (NS), Vol. 10, No. 1 (1976)

Yanagisako, Sylvia 2013. "Transnational Family Capitalism: Producing 'Made in Italy' in China." In *Vital Relations: Modernity and the Persistent Life of Kinship*, edited by Susan McKinnon and Fenella Cannell, 63–84. Santa Fe: SAR Press.

Carsten, J. 1995. "The Substance of Kinship and the Heat of the Hearth: Feeding, Personhood and Relatedness among Malays in Pulau Langkawi" *American Ethnologist* 22 (2): 223-41

Luiz, Costa 2017. The Owners of Kinship: Asymmetrical Relations in Indigenous Amazonia. Chicago: Hau Books.

Miller, Daniel 2007. "What is a Relationship? Is Kinship Negotiated Experience?" Ethnos, Journal of Anthropology, Vol. 7, issue 4.

Ragoné, Helena 2004. "Surrogate Motherhood and American Kinship" in R. Parkin & L. Stone (eds) Kinship and Family. An Anthropological Reader. Oxford: Blackwell.

Strathern, Marilyn 1992. Reproducing the future: essays in anthropology, kinship and the new reproductive technologies. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Bonaccorso, Monica 2008. Conceiving Kinship. Oxford: Berghahn Books

#### Lecture 2. Gender & Bodies

Central to concerns with kinship are the material bodies through which meanings are expressed and relations enacted. Anthropological studies of kinship and bodies and the work that people put into feeding, distinguishing and fashioning them allows us a view into the insistence of feminist anthropologists in the late 1970's of the importance of a "unified analysis" of gender and kinship. Attention to bodily acts, agency, and body topography open up possibilities of how we may understand the broader significance of the body for gender and kinship theory.

- How does kinship matter and what is its relationship to bodies, gender, race or sexuality?
- How might anthropological studies of particular bodily practices help to understand the families and relationships that ensue?

Howell, Signe 2003. "Kinning: The Creation of Life Trajectories in Transnational Adoptive Families" in *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, Sep., 2003, Vol. 9, No. 3 (Sep., 2003), pp. 465-484

R. Astuti. 1998. "It's a boy", "it's a girl!" Reflections on sex and gender in Madagascar and beyond'. In Lambek and Strathern (ed.) *Bodies and Persons*. Cambridge: CUP.

Boddy, Janice 1982. "Womb as Oasis: the Symbolic Context of Pharaonic circumcision in rural Northern Sudan" in *American Ethnologist* Vol 9, issue 4, pp 682-698

Hendriks, Thomas 2016. "SIM cards of desire: Sexual versatility and the male homoerotic economy in urban Congo" in *American Ethnologist, Vol. 43, No. 2, pp. 230–242* 

Sanabria, Emilia 2016. Plastic Bodies: Sex Hormones & Menstrual Suppression in Brazil. Ann Arbor: Duke University Press.

Reddy, Gayatri 2006. With respect to sex: Negotiating hijra identity in South India. Yoda Press.

Gay-y-Blasco, Paloma 1997. 'A "different" body? Desire and virginity among Gitanos.' *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 3(3): 517-535.

Kulick, Don 1997. 'The gender of Brazilian transgendered prostitutes', American Anthropologist 99(3): 574-585.

J.F. Collier & S.J. Yanagisako 1987. 'Introduction' and 'Toward a unified analysis of gender and kinship' in J.F. Collier & S.J. Yanagisako, eds. *Gender and Kinship*. Stanford: Stanford UP

Bear, L. Karen Ho, Anna Tsing and Silvia Yanagisako 2015. "Gens: A Feminist Manifesto for the Study of Capitalism". In Theorizing the Contemporary, *Fieldsights*, March 30, 2015. <a href="https://culanth.org/fieldsights/gens-a-feminist-manifesto-for-the-study-of-capitalism">https://culanth.org/fieldsights/gens-a-feminist-manifesto-for-the-study-of-capitalism</a>

#### Lecture 3. Love

This lecture addresses the misleading conception that romantic love just springs forth spontaneously between young and attractive people wherever they encounter each other. Anthropologists working on love and courting in different times and parts of the world have found it to be profoundly shaped by class, cultural values, kinship organization, gender relations and the state such that love is never merely found to spring forth but is heavily conditioned by the constraints and social standing of its participants, even when the love or sexuality in question stands in direct contestation to those very social values. This lecture will focus on homosexual and heterosexual romantic love, sexual desire and erotic relations to argue that an anthropological reading of love shows the ways in which it connects to other histories and processes to reveal a striking range of concerns. As an analytic, love tells us something about the changing relations between two people but also elicits a reflection of the processes at work within the larger social constellations of meaning and value in which it finds itself.

- What motivates relationships generated through desire, sexual encounter and the erotic economy?
- Are they qualitatively different to relationships of love, marriage, family and kin?

Gay, Judith 1986. "Mummies and Babies" and Friends and Lovers in Lesotho' in *Journal of Homosexual Studies*, Volume 11, 1986- Issue 3-4.

Brennan, Denise 2004. What's Love Got to Do with It?: Transnational Desires and Sex Tourism in the Dominican Republic, Duke University Press (https://read-dukeupress-edu.ezp.lib.cam.ac.uk/books/book/858/Whats-Love-Got-to-Do-with-It-Transnational)

Boellstorff, Tom 2005. *The Gay Archipelago: Sexuality & Nation in Indonesia*. Princeton: Princeton University Press (https://princetonup-degruyter-com.ezp.lib.cam.ac.uk/view/title/512042?tab\_body=toc)

Hendriks, 2017. SIM cards of desire: Sexual versatility and the male homoerotic economy in urban Congo (https://anthrosource-onlinelibrary-wiley com.ezp.lib.cam.ac.uk/doi/full/10.1111/amet.12301)

Hunter, Mark 2002. "The Materiality of Everyday Sex: thinking beyond prostitution" in African Studies, 61: 1, 99-120

Wardlow, H. 2006 Wayward Women: sexuality and agency in a New Guinean society. University of California Press

Hussain, Delwar. 2013. 'The Sexual Lives of Borderlanders', in *Boundaries Undermined: The Ruins of Progress on the Bangladesh-India Border*. London: Hurst.

Ramberg, Lucinda 2014. Given to the Goddess: South Indian Devadasis and the Sexuality of Religion. Durham: Duke University Press.

Reddy, Gayatri. 2006. 'The Bonds of Love: Companionate Marriage and the Desire for Intimacy among Hijras in Hyderabad, India', in Jennifer S. Hirsch and Holly Wardlow (eds.), *Modern Loves: The Anthropology of Romantic Courtship and Companionate Marriage*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

See also this online piece by Dr Nurul Huda Mohd Razif (2020) on polygamous relationships in Malaysia in the time of COVID-19. *Canopy Forum*: <a href="https://canopyforum.org/2020/06/30/polygamy-in-a-time-of-pandemic-hard-times-ahead/">https://canopyforum.org/2020/06/30/polygamy-in-a-time-of-pandemic-hard-times-ahead/</a>

# Lecture 4. Care

What is care and should it be neatly contained within the fields in which it is most immediately expressed and readily understood: that of the clinic and medical treatment, of bodily intervention by curative doctors, of technologies that seek to ameliorate bodily ills? Or is its ambit and scope far more wide and context- driven, encompassing what Yates-Doerr calls "field[s] of care" (2014) with its range of intimacies, political-economy, histories, relations and social structures that shape and define contexts in which care is expressed. This lecture looks at new anthropological studies of care to situate it as a worthwhile analytic capable of addressing ethnographic puzzles relating to how we understand relations of kinship and society at large.

- How has the anthropology of care characterised relations of autonomy and dependence in the context of kinship?
- How do states imagine the care of their citizens, and what do citizens make of states' attempts to care?

Borneman, John 2001. "Caring and to be Cared For: Displacing Marriage, Kinship, Gender & Sexuality" in J. Faubion (ed) *The Ethics of Kinship*. Lanham MD, Rowman & Littlefield (https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/CAM/detail.action?docID=1331681)

Mol, Annemarie, Ingunn Moser, and Jeanette Pols. 2010. "Care: Putting Practice into Theory." In *Care in Practice: On Tinkering in Clinics, Homes and Farms*. Annemarie Mol, Ingunn Moser, and Jeanette Pols, eds. Pp. 7-20. Bielefeld, Germany: Transcript Verlag.

Myers, Neely Laurenzo 2015. Recovery's Edge: An Ethnography of Mental Health Care and Moral Agency. Nashville: Vanderbilt (https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/CAM/detail.action?docID=4228970)

Stevenson, Lisa 2014. *Life Beside Itself: Imagining Care in the Canadian Arctic*. Oakland: University of California Press (https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/CAM/detail.action?docID=1711050)

Mody, Perveez 2019. "Kinship Care" in L. Gelsthorpe, P. Mody, & B. Sloan (eds) *Spaces of Care*, Chapter 10, pp. 183-199. Oxford: Hart

Reece, Koreen 2019. "Home & Away: Mobility & Care in Botswana's Time of AIDS" in Gelsthorpe, L., Mody, P. & Sloan, B. (eds) *Spaces of Care*, Chapter 11, pp. 201-217. Oxford: Hart

Parrenas, Rhacel 2005. Children of Global Migration. Stanford University Press: Stanford.

See Fieldnotes on Care (2014) for the Society of Cultural Anthropology, articles by Emily Yates-Doerr, Ruth Fitzgerald, Laura Heinnemann <a href="https://culanth.org/fieldsights/series/care">https://culanth.org/fieldsights/series/care</a>

# Example supervision topic

If kinship is not based on ties of "nature", blood or biology, what makes kin?

Carsten, J. 1995. "The Substance of Kinship and the Heat of the Hearth: Feeding, Personhood and Relatedness among Malays in Pulau Langkawi" *American Ethnologist* 22 (2): 223-41

Luiz, Costa 2017. The Owners of Kinship: Asymmetrical Relations in Indigenous Amazonia. Chicago: Hau Books.

Shakuto, Shiori 2019. "Postwork Intimacy: Negotiating romantic partnerships among Japanese retired couples in Malaysia" *American Ethnologist*, Vol. 46, No. 3, pp. 302-312.

Benson, Sue 2008. 'Mixed race children in south London: the management of an ambiguous ethnic identity', *Cambridge Anthropology* 27(2): 10-19.

Borneman, John 2001. "Caring and to be Cared For: Displacing Marriage, Kinship, Gender & Sexuality" in J. Faubion (ed) *The Ethics of Kinship*. Lanham MD, Rowman & Littlefield (https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/CAM/detail.action?docID=1331681)

Reece, Koreen 2019. "Home & Away: Mobility & Care in Botswana's Time of AIDS" in Gelsthorpe, L., Mody, P. & Sloan, B. (eds) *Spaces of Care*, Chapter 11, pp. 201-217. Oxford: Hart

Parrenas, Rhacel 2005. Children of Global Migration. Stanford University Press: Stanford.

Howell, Signe 2003. "Kinning: The Creation of Life Trajectories in Transnational Adoptive Families" in *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, Sep., 2003, Vol. 9, No. 3 (Sep., 2003), pp. 465-484

# Lecture series VI: Symbolism Dr. Rupert Stasch (Lent term, weeks 5-8)

These lectures explore how social anthropologists analyze symbolism, and what insights and challenges arise in recognizing human life to be symbolically mediated.

# Lecture 1. Introducing symbolism: signifiers standing for signifieds.

In everyday English, we often use the word *symbol* to mean a material object which stands for something else more abstract. This lecture introduces other terms for talking about relations of 'standing for.' The lecture asks us to see such relations as saturating human lives more extensively than we recognize in everyday talk, and it asks us to see what is strange and complex about the process of a symbol making present more than itself. Through the example of Korowai people's houses in Indonesian Papua, the lecture explores how symbolism is not usually a matter of 'A means B', but involves cascading networks of relations. We consider Durkheim's major early theory of the relation between symbolism and society, from *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*.

#### Readings

Stasch R. 2011. 'Korowai Treehouses and the Everyday Representation of Time, Belonging, and Death.' The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology 12: 327-347.

Durkheim, E. 1912. *Elementary Forms of Religious Life* [Fields translation], pp. 1-3, 7-9, 205-236, 433-448. Also read the table of contents.

Turner, T. 2012[1980]. 'The social skin'. Hau: Journal of Ethnographic Theory 2: 486-504.

### Lecture 2. Symbolic order and symbolic analysis.

This lecture looks at cross-cultural examples of the meanings of animals, as a means to explore the hypothesis that symbolism is often a patterned system that needs to be studied carefully in its own terms rather than explained by something else. We develop this point by revisiting the theoretical school known as 'structuralism', previously introduced in Michaelmas by Dr. Candea.

#### Readings

Saussure, F. de. 1906-1911 *Course in General Linguistics* [Baskin translation], pp. 7, 9, 14-15, 16, 65-69, 79-82, 87-90, 98-100, 107-129.

Lévi-Strauss, C. 1962 Totemism, pp. 1-32, 66-110.

Sahlins, M. 1976. 'Food Preference and Tabu in American Domestic Animals.' *Culture and Practical Reason* pp. 170-179

Leach, E. 1964 'Anthropological Aspects of Language: Animal Categories and Verbal Abuse'. In *New Directions in the Study of Language*, ed. E. Lennenberg, pp. 23-63.

Douglas, M. 1966. Purity and Danger, Chapter 3.

# Lecture 3. Performative Use of Symbols; Different Modes of 'Standing For'.

This lecture draws on examples of English speakers using fake Spanish expressions like 'Hasta la vista, baby,' and Apache speakers pejoratively impersonating Whites, to raise two issues central to all symbolism. First, individuals' use of symbols in specific situations is at the center of symbolic order itself, not separate from symbolic order. Second, symbols can stand for meanings in different ways. To appreciate the diversity of 'standing for' relations, the lecture introduces the idea of 'indexicality' (similar in some instances to 'connotation'). The lecture further asks whether it actually makes sense to oppose 'symbolic' and 'real' (as we often do in everyday speech). Via examples such as hunger or child-raising, the lecture explores the degree to which many material, causal processes are also fundamentally symbolic.

#### Readings

Hill, J. 2008. "Covert Racist Discourse: Metaphors, Mocking, and the Racialization of Historically Spanish-Speaking Populations in the United States." *The Everyday Language of White Racism,* pp. 119-157. Basso K. 1979. *Portraits of "the Whiteman": Linguistic Play and Cultural Symbols among the Western Apache.* Barthes, R. 1957. "Myth Today," pp. 107-130, 142-145 in *Mythologies* 

Munn, N. 1986. 'Food Transmission and food Consumption: The Basic Dialectic of Value Transformation', in *The Fame of Gawa*, pp. 49-73.

Foster R. 2018. Entropy, alchemy and negative pigs: Obviating the matter of wealth. *History and Anthropology* 29: 292-306.

Keane W. 2005. Signs are not the garb of meaning: on the social analysis of material things. In: Miller D (ed) *Materiality*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 182-205.

Newell S. 2018. The Affectiveness of Symbols: Materiality, Magicality, and the Limits of the Antisemiotic Turn. *Current Anthropology*: 1-22.

# Lecture 4. Symbolism and Subjectivity.

This lecture looks at art, stories, humor, and transgression as examples of areas where people are reflexive about their society's symbolic conventions. We use these examples to revisit earlier lectures' topics, but now with special attention to the relation between symbolism and subjective consciousness. We also consider challenges to symbolic theory posed by people's relations to gods, memories, places, social conflicts, or other areas where the 'meaning' of symbols includes qualities of uncertainty or contradiction in symbolic order itself.

#### Readings

Althusser, L. 1971. second half of "Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses." *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*, pp. 158-186 (i.e. starting from the section heading "On Ideology").

Allison A. 1991. Japanese mothers and obentōs: The lunch-box as ideological state apparatus. *Anthropological Quarterly*: 195-208.

Robbins J. 2007. You Can't Talk behind the Holy Spirit's Back: Christianity and Changing Language Ideologies in a Papua New Guinea Society. In: Makihara M and Schieffelin B (eds) Consequences of Contact: Language Ideologies and Sociocultural Transformations in Pacific Societies. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 125-139.

#### **Example Supervision Topic**

What is illuminated or obscured by analyzing spatial forms like buildings, or the bodies of humans or animals, as 'symbolic representations'?

#### Supervision topic readings: animals

Brightman R. (1993) Grateful Prey: Rock Cree Human-Animal Relationships, Berkeley: University of California Press. http://ark.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/ft0f59n6tb/

Candea, M. (2010) "I Fell in Love with Carlos the Meerkat": Engagement and Detachment in Human-Animal Relations'. *American Ethnologist*, 37: 241-58.

Howe, J. (1981) 'Fox Hunting as Ritual'. American Ethnologist, 8/2: 278-300.

Kohn, E. (2007) 'How Dogs Dream: Amazonian Natures and the Politics of Transspecies Engagement'. *American Ethnologist*, 34: 3-24.

Schieffelin E. (1976) *The Sorrow of the Lonely and the Burning of the Dancers*, New York: St. Martin's Press. Tambiah, S. (1969) 'Animals are Good to Think and Good to Prohibit'. *Ethnology* 8/4: 423-459.

Valeri V. (1992) If We Feed Them, We Do not Feed on Them: A Principle of Huaulu Taboo and its Application. *Ethnos* 57: 149-167.

Valeri V. (1994) Wild Victims: Hunting as Sacrifice and Sacrifice as Hunting in Huaulu. *History of Religions* 34: 101-131.

Valeri V. (2000) The Forest of Taboos: Morality, Hunting, and Identity among the Huaulu of the Moluccas, Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

White, Tom & Matei Candea (2018) 'Animals'. Cambridge Encyclopedia of Anthropology. http://www.anthroencyclopedia.com/entry/animals

Willerslev, R. (2004) 'Not Animal, Not Not-Animal: Hunting, Imitation, and Empathetic Knowledge among Siberian Yakaghirs'. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 10: 629-52.

#### Supervision topic readings: buildings

Bourdieu, P. (1977) 'The Kabyle House or the World Reversed', in *The Logic of Practice*. Oxford: Polity. Also in Mary Douglas (ed.) (1977) *Rules and Meanings*. London: Allen Lane.

Bowden, R. (1992) 'Art, architecture, and collective representations in a New Guinea society', in *Anthropology, Art, and Aesthetics*, eds J. Coote & A. Shelton, Oxford University Press, Oxford, pp. 67-93.

Cunningham, C. (1964) 'Order in the Atoni house', Bijdragen Tot de Taal-, Land-en Volkenkunde 120:34-68.

Enfield, N. J. (2009) 'Everyday ritual in the residential world', in *Ritual Communication*, eds G. Senft & E. Basso, Berg, Oxford, pp. 51-80.

Helliwell, C. (1992) 'Good walls make bad neighbours: The Dayak longhouse as a community of voices', *Oceania* 62:179-93.

Holston, J. (1989) *The Modernist City: An Anthropological Critique of Brasilia*. Chicago: University Press. Humphrey, C. (1974) 'Inside a Mongolian Tent'. *New Society*, October 1974.

Keane, W. (1995) 'The spoken house: Text, act, and object in eastern Indonesia', *American Ethnologist* 22:102-24.

Miller, D. (1988) 'Appropriating the State on the Council Estate'. Man (NS) 23: 353-372.

Sather, C. (1993) 'Posts, hearths and thresholds: The Iban longhouse as a ritual structure', in *Inside Austronesian Houses: Perspectives on Domestic Designs for Living*, ed. J. J. Fox, Canberra: RSPAS, ANU, pp. 64-115.

Stasch R. (2003) The Semiotics of World-making in Korowai Feast Longhouses. *Language & Communication* 23: 359-383.

# EASTER TERM Lecture series VII: Ethnography Prof. Joel Robbins (Easter Term, weeks 1 – 4)

Ethnographies – detailed accounts of the social life of a single society – are the one distinctively anthropological kind of writing. These lectures focus on the nature of ethnographic texts. Working in detail with the two set texts for SAN 1, the lectures explore productive ways of reading ethnographies and the best ways to take material from them to use in formulating anthropological arguments. Several lectures also take up issues of the relationship between ethnographic texts and anthropological theory. The core concern of the lectures, however, is on ways of learning about and working with ethnographic materials.

The crucial background reading for these lectures are the two set text ethnographies for SAN1:

Richards, A. (1982 [1956]) Chisungu: A Girl's Initiation Ceremony among the Bemba of Zambia. Second Edition. Introduction by J. S. La Fontaine. London: Routledge.

Robbins, J. (2004) Becoming Sinners: Christianity and Moral Torment in a Papua New Guinea Society. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Reading the Adam Kuper text listed below under Lecture 1 and the listed chapters from one of the two texts on kinship listed under Lecture 2 below would also be useful preparation.

# Lecture 1: Introduction to Ethnography; Ethnography and Social Structure.

This lecture discusses the nature and history of ethnography as a kind of writing and a way of handling the data produced by anthropological fieldwork. It also discusses the concept of social structure and suggests reasons why focusing on their presentations of data on social structure is a good way to formulate an initial reading of many ethnographies.

Kuper, Adam (1983) Anthropology and Anthropologists: The Modern British School. London: Routledge. Third Edition.

# Lecture 2: Ethnographies of Kin-Based Societies: Kinship and Social Structure.

This lecture discusses some of the basics of kinship analysis with an eye toward understanding how in some societies, including the two societies that are the focus in these lectures, kinship relations are the key building blocks of social structure. (Kinship will have been discussed in other lectures in SAN 1, but the presentation of this topic here will be somewhat different in emphasis.)

Read either: Fox, Robin (1967) Kinship and Marriage. Middlesex: Penguin Books; or Holy, Ladislav (1996) Anthropological Perspectives on Kinship. London: Pluto Press. [Holy is more recent, Fox is by now quite old and this shows in particular in its handling of gender, but it is also unusually clearly written and so it is worth consulting]. Chapters 4 and 6 in Fox's book or Chapter 5 in Holy's book are particularly relevant for this course, but reading one or the other in its entirety would be well worth the time.]

# Lectures 3 and 4: Bemba: Producing Families, Practicing Rituals.

These lectures explore Bemba society in detail. The first lecture lays out their social structure and some of the key challenges it presents to Bemba people. The second lecture looks at how the Chisungu ritual helps them to address these challenges.

Richards, Audrey (1982 [1956]) Chisungu: A Girl's Initiation Ceremony among the Bemba of Zambia. Second Edition. Introduction by J. S. La Fontaine. London: Routledge.

Richards, Audrey I. (1940) The Political System of the Bemba Tribe - North-Eastern Rhodesia. In *African Political Systems*. M. Fortes and E. E. Evans-Pritchard, eds. London: Oxford University Press.

# Lectures 5 and 6: Urapmin: Producing Moral Selves, Practicing Change.

The first lecture looks in detail at Urapmin social structure and at the process of radical religious change the Urapmin people have experienced as they have converted to Christianity. The Second lecture further considers the role tensions in Urapmin social structure have played in shaping the course of Urapmin conversion to Christianity, and it explores how Christian ritual life addresses these tensions.

Robbins, Joel (2004) Becoming Sinners: Christianity and Moral Torment in a Papua New Guinea Society. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Sahlins, Marshall (1985) Islands of History. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

### Lecture 7: Ethnography and Theory.

This lecture considers the relationship of ethnography to theory. It looks at the relationship between <u>Chisungu</u> and the structural-functionalist theoretical tradition and at *Becoming Sinners* and its relationship to the traditions of structuralism and symbolic anthropology.

Kuper, Adam (1999) *Among the Anthropologists: History and Context in Anthropology*. London: Athlone. (Chapter 7 "Audrey Richards: A Career in Anthropology").

Dumont, Louis (1980) *Homo Hierarchicus: The Caste System and its Implications*. M. Sainsbury, L. Dumont, and B. Gulati, transl. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. (Introduction and Postface: Toward a Theory of Hierarchy).

# Example Supervision Topic

#### What is the relationship between ritual and social structure among the Bemba?

(Starred readings are crucial, choose some from amongst the others)

\*Richards, A. (1982 [1956]) *Chisungu: A Girl's Initiation Ceremony among the Bemba of Zambia*. Second Edition. Introduction by J. S. La Fontaine. London: Routledge.

\*Richards, A. I. (1950) Some Types of Family Structure Amongst the Central Bantu. In *African Systems of Kinship and Marriage*. A. R. Radcliffe-Brown and D. Forde, eds. Pp. 207-251. London: Oxford University Press

Schneider, David M. (1961) Introduction: The Distinctive Features of Matrilineal Descent Groups. *In Matrilineal Kinship*. D. M. Schneider and K. Gough, eds. Pp. 1-29. Berkeley: University of California Press. \*Richards, Audrey I. (1968) Keeping the King Divine. *Proceedings of the Royal Anthropological Institute*. Pp. 23-35

Richards, Audrey I. (1940) The Political System of the Bemba Tribe - North-Eastern Rhodesia. In *African Political Systems*. M. Fortes and E. E. Evans-Pritchard, eds. London: Oxford University Press.

\*Gluckman, Max (1963) Order and Rebellion in Tribal Africa. London: Cohen and West. (Chapter 3, "Rituals of Rebellion in South-East Africa").

\*Handelman, D. 1998. *Models and Mirrors: Towards an Anthropology of Public Events*. New York: Berghahn Books. (Chapter 1: "Introduction") (There is a long discussion of the Chisungu ritual in this chapter which you may find interesting, but it is the on the list for the broader theoretical position the author sets out.) Moore, Henrietta L. (1997) 'Sex, Symbolism, and Psychoanalysis'. *Differences* 9(1):68-94.

Moore, Henrietta L. (2011) Still Life: Hopes, Desires and Satisfactions. Cambridge: Polity. (Read Chapter 2, "Still Life").

Rasing, Thera (2001) The Bush Burnt, the Stones Remain: Female Initiation Rites in Urban Zambia. Münster: Lit Verlag.

Hinfelaar, Hugo F. (1994) Bemba-Speaking Women of Zambia in a Century of Religious Change (1892-1902). Leiden: E.J. Brill.

\*Turner, Victor (1967) *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual.* Ithaca: Cornell University Press. [Read Chapter 1 "Symbols in Ndembu Ritual" and Chapter 3 "Colour Classification in Ndembu Ritual: A Problem in Primitive Classification"

Turner, Victor (1968) The Drums of Affliction: A Study of the Religious Process among the Ndembu of Zambia. Oxford: Oxford University Press. [Chapters 7 and 8 treat an initiation ritual somewhat like Chisungu in a neighbouring Bantu group].

#### MOCK EXAMINATION PAPER

Below is a mock exam paper which reflects the course content as it will be delivered in 2022-2023

The instructions on a SAN1 exam paper are as follows:

# Answer **three** questions.

Candidates will be expected to demonstrate a range of ethnographic knowledge in their answers, and to show a depth of knowledge of some specific ethnographic examples.

- 1. Discuss the strengths and weaknesses of **one or more** of these concepts as a key to understanding social stability and social change
  - a. culture
  - b. social structure
  - c. discourse
  - d. practice
- 2. What motivates relationships generated through love, care, sexual encounter and/or the erotic economy?
- 3. Why should one read the classics? Discuss with reference to **one or more** of the following theoretical traditions:
  - a. evolutionism
  - b. functionalism
  - c. structuralism
- 4. 'Weapons of the Weak are ineffective forms of resistance'. Critically discuss this claim with reference to a range of ethnographic and theoretical material.
- 5. 'Nationalism is a response to feelings of insecurity'. Critically discuss this claim with reference to a range of ethnographic and theoretical material.
- 6. What distinctive insight does anthropology's ethnographic method bring to one or more of the following topics
  - a. Protest
  - b. Borders
  - c. Platform capitalism
  - d. Conservation
  - e. Human-animal relations
- 7. 'Global health crises are not just about health.' Discuss.
- 8. Does kinship matter and what is its relationship to bodies, gender, race or sexuality?
- 9. What is illuminated or obscured by analyzing spatial forms like buildings, or the bodies of humans or animals, as 'symbolic representations'?
- 10. 'Conflict and inequality are the natural state of humankind'. Critically discuss this claim with reference to theoretical and ethnographic material.
- 11. 'The distinction between the symbolic and the real is of no value for anthropological analysis'. Discuss.
- 12. EITHER (a) 'The relationship between social structure and ritual is central to both *Chisungu* and *Becoming Sinners*'. Discuss.
  - OR (b) How do the different theoretical approaches of Audrey Richards and Joel Robbins shape their respective ethnographies, *Chisungu* and *Becoming Sinners*?